# MASS TRANSPORT IN, THROUGH, FROM FOOD PACKAGING

# PERMEATION, MIGRATION, DIFFUSION, SORPTION, REGULATION, RISK ASSESSMENT/MANAGEMENT

olivier.vitrac@agroparistech.fr



Joint Research Unit 1145 **Food Engineering and Processing** Group Interactions between Materials and Media in Contact, AgroParisTech site de Massy











- PERMEATION & BARRIER MATERIALS
- MIGRATION ISSUES
- TOXICITY
- REGULATION
- DIFFUSION IN POLYMERS
- CONCLUSIONS























Home > Law > Law-making process > Planning and proposing law > Impact assessments

#### Impact assessments

Impact assessments examine whether there is a need for EU action and analyse possible impacts of available solutions. These are carried out during the preparation phase, before the Commission finalises a proposal for a new law. They provide evidence to inform and support the decision-making process.

#### PAGE CONTENTS

The need for impact assessments

**Better law-making** 

How to contribute

Cooperation between EU institutions

#### Subsidiarity and proportionality

#### The need for impact assessments

Impact assessments are carried out on initiatives expected to have significant economic, social or environmental impacts. These can be:

- legislative proposals
- non-legislative initiatives (e.g. financial programmes, recommendations for the negotiations of international agreements)

COMMISSION

PABLIAMEN

• implementing and delegated acts







Contribution of INRA











EFSA has issued upward of 140 positive scientific opinions on the safety of processes to recycle plastics for use in food contact material.





500 M€ have been invested in plants capable of converting recycled plastic materials into materials suitable for packaging and food contact applications

In 2014, more than 50% of the recycled PET in Europe was used in food contact applications.



The lack of harmonisation amongst Member States generates legal uncertainty and unnecessary burden for the industry using recycled materials.

#### It also sets up obstacles for the Circular Economy







mineral oils can be transferred without contact and lead to cross-contamination between materials





RECYCLED PET FOR FOOD CONTACT IS ATHORIZED (282/2008/EC) RECYCLED POLYOLEFINS IS AUTHORIZED ONLY IN GERMANY RECYCLED PAPER AND BOARDS IS SOURCE OF RECURING CRISES IN EU



CANCO: Ensuring the safety of consumers: can coatings for direct food contact.



#### Bisphenol A Exposure Causes Meiotic Aneuploidy in the Female Mouse

Current Biology, Vol. 13, 546-553, April 1, 2003, ©2003 Elsevier Science Ltd. All rights reserved. DOI 10.1016/S0960-9822(03)00189-1

Patricia A. Hunt,1\* Kara E. Koehler, Martha Susiarjo,1 Craig A. Hodges,1 Arlene Ilagan,<sup>1</sup> Robert C. Voigt,<sup>2,5</sup> Sally Thomas,<sup>3</sup> Brian F. Thomas,<sup>4</sup> and Terry J. Hassold<sup>1</sup> Department of Genetics <sup>2</sup>Animal Resource Center Case Western Reserve University Cleveland, Ohio 44106-4955 <sup>3</sup>Thoren Caging Systems Hazleton, Pennsylvania 18201 <sup>4</sup>RTI International Research Triangle Park, North Carolina 27709-2194

Summan

.

Background: There is increasing concern that exposure to man-made substances that mimic endogenous hormones may adversely affect mammalian reproduction. Although a variety of reproductive complications have been ascribed to compounds with androgenic or estrogenic properties, little attention has been directed at the potential consequences of such exposures to the genetic quality of the gamete.

Results: A sudden, spontaneous increase in meiotic disturbances, including aneuploidy, in studies of oocytes from control female mice in our laboratory coincided with the accidental exposure of our animals "

environmental source of bisphenol A (BPA) BP estrogenic compound widely used in the polycarbonate plastics and epoxy resins. damaged caging material as the source of as we were able to recapitulate the meiot ties by intentionally damaging cages and In subsequent studies of female mice, we daily oral doses of BPA to directly test th

that low levels of BPA disrupt female meiosis. Our results demonstrated that the meiotic effects were dose dependent and could be induced by environmentally relevant doses of BPA.

Conclusions: Both the initial inadvertent exposure and subsequent experimental studies suggest that BPA is a potent meiotic aneugen. Specifically, in the female mouse, short-term, low-dose exposure during the final stages of oocyte growth is sufficient to elicit detectable meiotic effects. These results provide the first unequivocal link between mammalian meiotic aneuploidy and an accidental environmental exposure and suggest that the oocyte and its meiotic spindle will provide a sensitive assay system for the study of reproductive toxins.

#### Introduction

An estimated 10%-25% of fertilized human oocvtes are aneuploid; thus, numerical chromosome abnormalities

\*Correspondence: pah13@po.cwru.edu Present address: Lab Products, 742 Sussex Avenue, P.O. Box 639 Seaford, Delaware 19973.

are the leading cause of miscarriage, congenital defects, and mental retardation [1]. Because almost all such aneuploidy derives from meiotic errors, considerable effort has been directed at identifying factors that increase meiotic nondisjunction. A number of potential risk factors, including irradiation (e.g., [2, 3]), smoking or drinking (e.g., [4, 5]), oral contraceptives and fertility drugs (e.g., [4, 6]), and environmental pollutants/pesticides (e.g., [7]), have been suggested. However, significant effects have been small and difficult to verify or disputed, making positive associations hard to establish. In part, this may reflect difficulties in detection. For example, the extraordinary effect of maternal age on aneuploidy may obscure less obvious associations. Further, previous studies may have focused on the "wrong" population; that is, most utilized liveborns, although virtually all aneuploidy terminates in miscarriage. Thus, the contribution of environmental insults to meiotic chromosome errors remains unknown.

We recently experienced an inadvertent environmental exposure in our mouse colony to 2,2-(4,4-dihydroxydiphenol)propane, or bisphenol A. Bisphenol A (BPA) is the monomer that is polymerized to manufacture polycarbonate plastic products and resins, such as those used to line cans containing food and beverages and those found in dental sealents. The exposure was accompanied by highly significant increases in meiotic some abnormalities, including nondisjunction; chrc A was implicated as a potent disruptor

e ability to experimentally recreate the llowed us to verify our initial observations lose-response studies.

#### A Sudden Increase in Meiotic Abnormalities Is Correlated with Damage to Caging Materials

We recently reported meiotic studies of mouse mutants with defects in the alignment of the chromosomes on the first meiotic (MI) spindle [8]. This meiotic abnormality, which we have termed congression failure (Figure 1), is of particular relevance to humans because it is an agerelated feature of human oocytes and has been postulated to be causally related to the well-known increase in aneuploidy associated with advancing maternal age [9]. In the course of meiotic studies of mouse oocvtes conducted in 1998, we observed a sudden and dramatic change in congression failure levels. The first wave of follicles that initiate growth in the sexually immature ovary provides access to a large cohort of oocytes, and, typically, only 1%-2% of oocytes from control females exhibit congression failure at metaphase I [8]. However, in experiments conducted in August 1998, congression failure levels suddenly spiked, and approximately 40% of control oocytes exhibited this phenotype or more severe aberrations (Figures 1 and 2).

At the same time that these studies were being conducted, we were also using the animal facility to house

#### Current Biology Report

#### **Replacement Bisphenols Adversely Affect Mouse Gametogenesis** with Consequences for Subsequent Generations

Tegan S. Horan,<sup>1</sup> Hannah Pulcastro,<sup>1</sup> Crystal Lawson,<sup>1</sup> Roy Gerona,<sup>2</sup> Spencer Martin,<sup>2</sup> Mary C. Gieske,<sup>1</sup> Caroline V. Sartain,1 and Patricia A. Hunt1,3,1

•

School of Molecular Biosciences, Center for Reproductive Biology, Washington State University, Pullman, WA, USA 2School of Medicine, University of California, San Francisco, CA, USA

<sup>3</sup>Lead Contact \*Correspondence: pathunt@wsu.edu

https://doi.org/10.1016/j.cub.2018.06.070

#### SUMMARY

20 years ago, accidental bisphenol A (BPA) exposure caused a sudden increase in chromosomally abnormal eggs from our control mice [1]. Subsequent rodent studies demonstrated developmental effects of exposure with repercussions on adult health and fertility (e.g., [2-9]; reviewed in [10-17]). Studies in monkeys, humans, fish, and worms suggest BPA effects extend across species (e.g., [18-30]; reviewed in [31-33]). Widespread use has resulted in ubiquitous environmental contamination meiotic effects. and human BPA exposure. Consumer co ce 17 sulted in "BPA-free" products produ turally similar bisphenols that are

environmental and human conta [34-41]). We report here studies initi changes mirroring our previous E and implicating exposure to BPS ( replacement) from damaged polysurone car es.

Like with BPA [1, 2, 5], our data show that exposure to common replacement bisphenols induces germline effects in both sexes that may affect multiple generations. These findings add to growing evidence of the biological risks posed by this class of chemicals. Rapid production of structural variants of BPA and other EDCs circumvents efforts to eliminate dangerous chemicals, exacerbates the regulatory burden of safety assessment, and increases environmental contamination. Our experience suggests that these environmental contaminants pose a risk not only to reproductive health but also to the integrity of the research environment. EDCs, like endogenous hormones, can affect diverse processes. The sensitivity of the germline allows us to detect effects that, although not immediately apparent in other systems, may induce variability that undermines experimental reproducibility and impedes scientific advancement.

In the course of meiotic studies in male and female mice, we observed variation in meiotic recombination (measured by the number of MLH1 foci in pachytene stage mejocytes), with levels in some controls reaching values characteristic of BPA-exposed animals [2, 5]. Although the change in pooled data was subtle, variation among litters was striking (Figure 1), Given our previous experience with BPA leaching from polycarbonate cages and water bottles [1], damaged materials were an obvious suspect. When white residue was evident on the surface of some polysulfone cages in our facility (Figure 2A), we suspected that exposure to chemicals leaching from the damaged polymer was eliciting

#### nexpected Contaminant

s comprised of BPA and diphenyl sulfone (Figwe suspected that these were the contaminants quid chromatography-tandem mass spectrometry analysis of a methanol extraction of damaged car, demonstrated the presence of both BPA and 2C-2F). Because polymeric aromatic ethers, like ric counterparts, cannot undergo nucleophilic sub-

stitution to generate an unsubstituted aromatic ring at the reaction site, degradation results in the formation of a phenolic group. Therefore, damaged polysulfone is, in fact, more likely to generate BPS than diphenyl sulfone is (Figure 2B). Unfortunately, high signal levels in both control and solvent blanks made it impossible to determine if diphenyl sulfone was a significant contaminant.

Replacement bisphenols have rapidly emerged in consumer products, and studies of them are limited. However, plastics containing them can leach estrogenic chemicals [43, 44], and exposure has been reported to induce adverse effects similar to BPA (e.g., [45-52]; reviewed in [53]). Our findings suggest that, although newer polymers like polysulfone are more resistant to chemical damage than polycarbonate is, damage can occur in the course of normal use and may result in the release of contaminants that are not constituent components of the polymer

#### **Bisphenol Analogs Elicit Meiotic Effects**

To eliminate contamination, all caging materials in the facility were replaced, new breeding stocks were purchased, and studies were conducted to confirm that control values in both

Current Biology 28, 1-7, September 24, 2018 © 2018 Elsevier Ltd. 1







Environ Sci Pollut Res (2009) 16:278-286 DOI 10.1007/s11356-009-0107-7

AREA 6 • PERSISTANT ORGANIC POLLUT

#### Endocrine disruptors in bot estrogenic burden and migr

Martin Wagner · Jörg Oehlmann

Received: 6 November 2008 / Accepted: 18 December 2008 C The Author(s) 2009. This article is published with open :

#### Abstract

D Springer

Background, aim, and scope Food consumption important route of human exposure to endocrine-dis chemicals. So far, this has been demonstrated by e. modeling or analytical identification of single substa foodstuff (e.g., phthalates) and human body fluid urine and blood). Since the research in this field is foc few chemicals (and thus missing mixture effects), the contamination of edibles with xenohormones is unknown. The aim of this study was to assess the int estrogenic burden of bottled mineral water as mode stuff and to characterize the potential sources of th genic contamination.

Materials, methods, and results In the present stu analyzed commercially available mineral water in an system with the human estrogen receptor alpha and e estrogenic contamination in 60% of all samples maximum activity equivalent to 75.2 ng/l of the nat hormone 17β-estradiol. Furthermore, breeding of t luskan model Potamopyrgus antipodarum in water made of glass and plastic [polyethylene terep] (PET)] resulted in an increased reproductive ou snails cultured in PET bottles. This provides first e that substances leaching from plastic food pas materials act as functional estrogens in vivo.

Responsible editor: Markus Hecker	NATURE REVIEWS ENDOCRINOLOGY		
M. Wagner (E3) - J. Oehlmann Department of Aquatic Ecotoxicology, Johann Wolfgang Goethe University, Siesmayerstr. 70 A, 60054 Frankfurt am Main, Germany e-mail: wagner@bio.ami-frankfurt.de	cussed (Safe 2000, 2005; S 2005) due to the multifacto diseases, although evidence to xenohormones and deve tive disorders strengthens (S		

#### EDITORIAL

#### The perils of plastic

fround-robin' spam e-mail that is cir servers worldwide claims that drinl water that has been left in a warm c breast cancer. Is this warning just an urban r it hold a grain of truth? The FDA, it seems. the side of caution; earlier this year, the o revised its position on the safety of bisphene chemical used in the manufacture of plastic deemed safe for food-contact use, the FI expressed "some concern" about the potentia that BPA poses to fetuses, infants and young What exactly is BPA and why has its alarm? First synthesized in 1905, BPA has s a key component in the production of plas ing polycarbonate and epoxy resins. Polyc clear, heat-resistant, shatter-proof materia that make it ideal for the manufacture of dr particularly those used by young children Epoxy resins are also used by the food a industry-they provide the protective co inside many metal-based cans. Standard tests supported the safety of BPA and the FI it for food-contact use in the 1960s. Over years, however, concern has mounted th environmental exposure to BPA might dis

functioning of the endocrine system. The term 'endocrine disruption' was coine 1990s. Endocrine disruptors comprise a dive industrial chemicals that exert numerous de and functional effects on the endocrine syst tiple biological pathways. Many of these cher the effects of endogenous hormones, such BPA and other endocrine-disrupting che been implicated in obesity, neurological de ductive dysfunction and cancer. In addition octanoic acid (PFOA) and perfluorooctar (PFOS)—common household chemicals for stick' and waterproof materials-have re linked to thyroid disease.

The Endocrine Society has recognized t problems associated with the widespread u trial chemicals. In June 2009, the society p findings of a task force commissioned to the mechanisms of action and potential he endocrine disruptors (Diamanti-Kandara

	WATER BESEARCH 46 (2012) 571-583	
AND AND AND A	Available online at www.sciencedirect.com	3
2.5.1	SciVerse ScienceDirect	
ISEVIER	journal homepage: www.elsevier.com/locate/watres	

#### Chemical compounds and toxicological assessments of drinking water stored in polyethylene terephthalate (PET) bottles: A source of controversy reviewed

#### Cristina Bach<sup>a,b,\*</sup>, Xavier Dauchy<sup>a</sup>, Marie-Christine Chagnon<sup>c</sup>, Serge Etienne<sup>b</sup>

\* ANSES, Nancy Laboratory for Hydrology, Water Chemistry Department, 40 rue Lionnois, 54000 Nancy, France Institute Jean Lamour, UMR 7198, Department SI2M, Ecole des Mines de Nancy, Nancy-University, Parc de Saurupt, CS 14234, 54042 Nancy, France

<sup>6</sup>Derttech "Packtox", University of Burgundy, 1 Esplanade Erasme, AaroSupDiion Nord, 21000 Diion, France

ARTICLE INFO	ABSTRACT			
Article history: Received 27 July 2011 Received in revised form 21 November 2011 Accepted 22 November 2011 Available online 6 December 2011	A declaration of conformity according to Turopean regulation No. 10/2011 is required to ensure the stafey of plastic materials in contact with foodstruffs. This regulation estab- liabed a positive list of substances that are authorized for use in plastic materials. Some compounds are subject to restrictions and/or specifications according to their toxicological data. Despite this, the analysis of PET reveals some non-intentionally added substances (NAS) produced by authorized initial reactants and additives.			
Reywords: Roatled water Matagenicity Cenotoxicity Tradoctine disruptors NRAS	Genotacic and estrogenic activities in RT-bottled water have been reported. Chemical mixtures in bottled water have been suggested as the source of these textological effects. Furthermore, sample preparation techniques, such as solid-phase extraction (SPR), to extract estrogen-like compounds in bottled water accontrowerial. It has been suggested that inappropriate extraction methods and sample reatment may result in fails-ensuring end to combine chemical analysis with bioassays to carry out hazard assessments. Formalelyse, accelladolyse and animony are clearly related to migration from FET into water. However, several studies have shown other theoretically unexpected submit of the clearly end to the clear of the clear strategies and the clear strategies and the compounds have the clearly estable to basind oper Creation strate. The conject of these clearly estable to bene clearly estab- tion are estimated as the clear strategies of the clear strategies are strategies and the clear strategies and the clear strategies are strategies and the clear strategies of the clear strategies are strategies and the clear strategies of the clear strategies the result of the clear strategies of the clear strategies that may be present therein. Our literature review shows that contradictory results for PET-			

List of abbreviations: AA, acetaldehvde; APEOs, polvethoxylated nonvlphenols; BBP, benzylbutyl phthalate; BHET, bis/hvdroxyethvl Lat of adversations: AA, acetadetryde: AFEO, polyethoxyfaled nosyfphenols; BBP, benryfluchyj phthalane; BBT, bullyndroxyfalen, BCA, bully SEC-HFLC, size exclusion chromatography-high performance liquid chromatography; SML, specific migration limits; SPE, solid-phase extraction; SPME, solid-phase micro-extraction; SODIS, solar water disinfection; TPA, terephthalic acid; TDI, tolerable daily intake; TNPP, \*Constant and a state of the state of the

Tel.: +33 383 38 87 29; fax: +33 383 38 87 20. E-mail address: cristina.bach@anses.fr (C. Bach

0043-1354/\$ - see front matter @ 2011 Elsevier Ltd. All rights reserved doi:10.1016/j.watres.2011.11.062





Role of INRA Scientific support to global and local solutions and assessments



# AgroParisTech



#### THE SCHOOL OF PACKAGING MICHIGAN STATE UNIVERSITY





#### THIS LECTURE: <u>http://modmol.agroparistech.fr/masterEU/</u>

- MY LECTURES AT MSU (MI,USA): http://www.fshn.msu.edu/events/event/Vitrac DIFFUSION https://mediaspace.msu.edu/media/dr.+olivier+vitrac +presentsa+diffusion+coefficients+of+organic+solut es+in+polymersa/1\_zz20dgt9 PARTITIONING https://mediaspace.msu.edu/media/Dr.+Olivier+Vitrac +presentsA+An+atomistic+Flory-Huggins+formulation+for+the+tailored+prediction+of +activity+and+partition+coefficients/1\_uzi6h91k SAFETY MANAGEMENT: https://mediaspace.msu.edu/media/WorkshopA+Pred iction+of+the+migrationA+beyond+conventional+esti mates\*/1\_won1m7aw
- RISK ASSESSMENT: https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=7LMnc4czpuY



#### DESORPTION OF PACKAGING CONSTITUENTS (ADDITIVES, MONOMERS AND OLIGOMERS, NIAS...) SELF-SIMILAR SITUATIONS WHICH OBEY

#### TO THE GENERAL MODEL OF DIFFSION-SOLUBILIZATION





1>>> INTRODUCTION/ MASS TRANSFER PHENOMENA AS OBJECT OF STUDY

Fo =

#### PERMEATION OFFOOD CONTENTS PERMEATION FROM ENVIRONMENT



Fukushima-Daichi; March 12th, 201



.017





# **REGULATION 10/2011/EC**



#### What is migration ?







## **FOOD PACKAGING INTERACTIONS**

#### Example of sterilized product







.021

01/04/2020



#### **Coupled mass transfer**

between the food product and the packaging material





# FOOD PACKAGING MATERIALS

THERMOPLASTICS, ELASTOMERS



### **Classification of polymers**

**Thermoplastics** : A thermoplastic, or thermosoftening plastic, is a polymer that melts, and returns to a solid state upon cooling.

Examples : PE, PP, PS, PVC ...

**Thermosets** : A thermosetting plastic, also known as a thermoset, is polymer material that irreversibly cures. The cure may be induced by heat, generally above 200 °C, through a chemical reaction, or suitable irradiation

Examples : Phenolic, epoxydes ...

**Elastomers** : An elastomer is a polymer with viscoelasticity (colloquially "elasticity") *Exemples* : Silicones, natural rubber ...





#### **Polyolefins : PE – PP**



PP (atactic) Polypropylene

PP (isotactic)

Polypropylene

#### POLYOLEFINS

- LDPE
- Vapour barrier

#### (Low density polyethylene)

- Flexibility for seals
- Mouldability Tearability
  - Flexibility Excellent
  - stretchability . Sterilisation
  - Chemical inertness
  - Transparency Tactile effect

- Trays Boxing
- Screw or clip tops Nozzles
- Stretchable and retractable films for bundling (multiple-unit packs) and palletting . Bottles
- Stopper seals Carrier bags
- Small bags Tubes

#### HDPE

(High Density Polyethylene)

- Vapour barrier • Mouldability • Rigidity
- (for mechanical testing) Impact resistance • Chemical inertness · Resistance to stress-cracking
  - Sterilisation Suitable for freezing (-40°C) • Opaqueness

- Large drums
- Screw or clip tops
- Bottles
- Crates and cases Covers
- Films for postal dispatch
- Flasks Drums and reusable
- containers Pots Tubes

- Rigidity (Resistance to sterilisation) (Polypropylene) • Resistance to cold • Vapour barrier
  - Chemical inertness
  - Suitable for freezing (-40°C)
  - Suitable for micro-waves (+120°C)
  - Low density
  - · Resistant to stress-cracking
  - Resistant to folding Thermal packing . Contact transparency
  - Clarified PP
  - OPP (oriented PP)
  - EPP (expanded polypropylene:
  - resistance to repeated impact)

- Alveolate material Tray containers
- Screw and clip tops
- Reusable crates and cases Covers
- Thermoforming sheets
- Transparent films and bags
- Bottles
- Reheatable plates Pots
- Tubs Tubes
- Flasks
- Films
- Reusable wrapping





#### PET

- (Polyethylene terephthalate)
- Resistant to stress-cracking • Gas barrier
- (C)PET (crystallised):

(A)PET (amorphous):

• Shiny • Impact resistant

• Resistant to internal pressure

- same properties as (A)PET
- but not transparent
- Temperature resistant to 220° C
- PETG (glycol): amorphous, same properties as (A)PET

- Tray containers Boxes Bottles
- Transparent Perfume compatible • Lids
  - Thermoforming sheets
  - Films Flasks Pots
  - Oven trays (220°C)
  - Blister packs Bottles
  - Films Flasks Pots
  - Tray containers Lids • Thermoforming sheets

• Gas barrier

• UV barrier

PET/PEN

copolymer



#### PET Polyethylene terepthalate

Bottles

• Flasks

PETE

#### POLYCARBONATES



#### **MIGRATION CLASSES**

Polymer	Formulation level	Degradation products	Interaction s with fatty food	Interaction s with alcohols and acids	Contamination risk
PET	+	++ (acetaldéhyde, cyclic trimer)	-	+	+
PE	+++++	+++ (carbonyled compounds)	++++	-	++++
PP	+++++	+++ (carbonyled compounds)	+++	-	+++++
PS	+++	++ phenol, benzaldehyde, acetophenone	+++	non documente d	+++(+)
PVC	+++ à +++++ (si plastifié)	++ HCI	+++	non documente d	+++ to ++++++



+++++

+ to +++

+ to +++

Ink

# Polymeric Layer Polymeric Layer Polymeric Layer





# Laminates







**PR** 


# **Critical temperatures for polymers**

# Glass transition temp. $T_a$ Melting point $T_m$ Liquid 2 Rubbery Specific Volume State Glassy State Crystalline State

$$T_{g} = T_{g\infty} - \frac{K}{\left\langle M_{n} \right\rangle}$$

INRA

Τg

Temperature

 $T_{f}$ 



 $T_g \approx \frac{2}{3}T_m$ 





**→** 

TOWARDS BIODEGRADABLE POLYMERS	polymer	Tg (°C)	Tm (°C)
e.g.	PE	-120	60
	PCL	-60	60
La	PBSA	-45	114
$\mathbf{y}_{\mathbf{y}} = \mathbf{y}_{\mathbf{y}} = \mathbf{y}_{\mathbf{y}}$	PEA	-30	112
Long Opman	PBAT	-30	110
T T T T T T T T T T T T T T T T T T T	PHBV <sub>15</sub>	+5	145
	PHB	+10	175
	PLA	+58	+152
	EVOH	+60	+190
~lop-lop-lop-	PET	+90	+270
	Proteins		
	Starch	>200	Degradation
	Hemicelluloses	@0% RH	melting
HO OH O	Cellulose		



# PERMEATION

# OVERVIEW OF BARRIER PERFORMANCES

#### **TABLE 12.1**

# Degree of Protection Required by Various Foods and Beverages (Assuming 1 Year Shelf Life at 25°C)

Food/Beverage	Maximum Amount of O <sub>2</sub> Gain (ppm)	Other Gas Protection Needed	Maximum Water Gain or Loss	Requires High Oil Resistance	Requires Good Barrier to Volatile Organics
Canned milk and flesh foods	1–5	No	3% Loss	Yes	No
Baby foods	1-5	No	3% Loss	Yes	Yes
Beers and wine	1–5	<20% CO <sub>2</sub> (or SO <sub>2</sub> ) loss	3% Loss	No	Yes
Instant coffee	1-5	No	2% Gain	Yes	Yes
Canned soups, vegetables and sauces	1–5	No	3% Loss	No	No
Canned fruits	5-15	No	3% Loss	No	Yes
Nuts, snacks	5-15	No	5% Gain	Yes	No
Dried foods	5-15	No	1% Gain	No	No
Fruit juices and drinks	10-40	No	3% Loss	No	Yes
Carbonated soft drinks	10-40	<20% CO <sub>2</sub> loss	3% Loss	No	Yes
Oils and shortenings	50-200	No	10% Gain	Yes	No
Salad dressings	50-200	No	10% Gain	Yes	Yes
Jams, jellies, syrups, pickles, olives, vinegars	50-200	No	10% Gain	Yes	No
Liquors	50-200	No	3% Loss	No	Yes
Condiments	50-200	No	1% Gain	No	Yes
Peanut butter	50-200	No	10% Gain	Yes	No

Source: Adapted from Salame, M., The use of low permeation thermoplastics in food and beverage packaging, in: Permeability of Plastic Films and Coatings, Hopfenberg, H.B. (Ed.), Plenum, New York, p. 275, 1974.

#### Example 12.1

A breakfast cereal has an initial moisture content  $m_i$  of 2.5%. The COP is the critical moisture content  $m_c$  of 8% due to loss of crispness (Robertson, 2011a). The equilibrium moisture content  $m_e$  at 25°C is 14.8% and the pseudo-equilibrium moisture content  $m'_e$  obtained by extension of the linear portion of the isotherm is 11%; the slope of the line (*b*) is 0.147 g H<sub>2</sub>O/g solids/unit  $a_w$  (see Figure 12.4).



**FIGURE 12.4** Schematic of a typical moisture sorption isotherm for breakfast cereal with a superimposed straight line of slope *b*. Initial  $(m_i)$ , critical  $(m_c)$  and equilibrium  $(m_e)$  moisture contents are indicated together with the pseudo-equilibrium  $(m'_c)$  moisture content used for package shelf life calculations.

Calculate the shelf life of the cereal if it is packaged in a bag of  $50 \mu m$  LDPE or  $50 \mu m$  OPP. The weight of dry cereal in the package is 400g and the dimensions of the bags are  $20 \text{ cm} \times 30 \text{ cm}$ . The packed product is to be stored at  $25^{\circ}$ C and 75% RH.

Surface area of the bags is  $20 \times 30 = 600 \text{ cm}^2 = 0.06 \text{ m}^2$ 

Vapour pressure of pure water at 25°C = 2.3756 cm Hg

Data from a plastic film supplier indicated that WVTRs determined at 25°C/75% RH were

 $50 \,\mu\text{m}\,\text{LDPE} = 8.0 \,\text{g}\,\text{m}^{-2}\,\text{day}^{-1}$ 

 $50 \,\mu m \,OPP = 1.35 \,g \,m^{-2} \,day^{-1}$ 

These WVTRs must be converted into water vapor permeances P/X by dividing by the driving force for water vapor transfer. The saturated water vapor pressure at 25°C is (from Table 4.10) 2.376. Thus, the driving force at 25°C/75% RH is

 $2.376 \times 0.75 = 1.782 \text{ cm Hg}$ 

For LDPE film,

$$\frac{P}{X} = \frac{8.0 \text{g}}{\text{m}^2 \text{day}} \times \frac{1}{1.782 (\text{cmHg})}$$
$$= 4.489 \text{gH}_2 \text{Om}^{-2} \text{dav}^{-1} (\text{cmHg})$$

For OPP film,

$$\frac{P}{X} = \frac{1.35 \text{g}}{\text{m}^2 \text{day}} \times \frac{1}{1.782 (\text{cmHg})}$$

 $= 0.758 \text{gH}_2 \text{Om}^{-2} \text{day}^{-1} (\text{cmHg})^{-1}$ 

Substituting into Equation 12.10 for cereal packed in LDPE film,

$$\ln \frac{11-2.5}{11-8} = 4.489 \cdot \frac{0.06}{400} \cdot \frac{2.3756}{0.147} \cdot \theta_s$$
(12.12)

Solving for shelf life  $\theta_{s}$ ,

$$\theta_{s} = \frac{[ln2.833]}{1.088 \times 10^{-2}}$$
$$= \frac{1.0413}{1.088 \times 10^{-2}}$$
$$= 96 \text{ days}$$

If the cereal were packed in OPP film instead,

$$\theta_{s} = \frac{[ln2.833]}{1.837 \times 10^{-3}}$$
  
= 567 days

The shelf life is inversely related to the water vapor permeances of the film; since P/X for LDPE is 5.9 times that for OPP, the shelf life in the latter film is 5.9 times that in the former. If the required shelf life were, say, 300 days, then Equation 12.10 could be recalculated using  $t_s = 300$  and solved for P/X. From this, the corresponding WVTR could be calculated and the film supplier requested to supply a film that met this specification at 25°C and 75% RH.

As noted earlier, the shelf lives calculated earlier will be longer than what would be achieved in practice because the pseudo-equilibrium moisture content  $m_e$  used in the calculations is less than the actual equilibrium moisture content, which is the real driving force for water vapor transport. Because of the simplifying assumptions made in the earlier calculations, the calculated shelf lives should be verified by actual shelf life testing.

### FOOD PRODUCT DESIGN

#### PACKAGING ISSUES







## HOW TO ADAPT PACKAGING DESIGN TO FOOD PRODUCT SPECIFICATIONS ?







#### FOOD PRODUCT DESIGN N.

#### PERMEATION ISSUES









#### FOOD PRODUCT DESIGN

#### PACKAGING ISSUES

### Relative Reaction rate

#### Water content



Global Food Stability Map (adapted from Labuza et al., 1969)





# HIGH BARRIER: FFV/CED



# SELECTIVITY



**FIG. 22-73** Plot of separation factor versus permeability for many polymers,  $O_2/N_2$ . Abscissa—"Fast Gas Permeability,  $\rho(O_2)$  Barrers." Ordinate—"Selectivity,  $\alpha$  ( $O_2/N_2$ )."

#### **BARRIERS TO GASES**

#### MULTILAYER MATERIALS

It is well known that traditional polymers are permeable to gazes such as oxygen,  $CO_2$ , vapor This property can become critical for food conservation or storage of gaseous beverages. This is the reason why, in most of the cases, multilayers structures are used. They are composed of a core barrier material and inert outerlayers like polyolefin. Typical Barrier materials are highly crystalline like EVOH, Polyamide, polyester. Aluminium foil or Carton can also be used (example Tetrapak).



MATERIALS	Applications	Recyclability
PA/PE	Applications: ham, meat cheese, pasta PA provides oxygen barrier and outer abrasion resistance whereas PE provides sealability and flexibility.	blends require to be compatibilized
PA/EVOH/PE	PA6 provides mechanical strength and abrasion resistance, EVOH provides oxygen barrier, PE provides sealability and protects EVOH against moisture.	

## SORPTION AND DIFFUSION OF HE IN ENTANGLED POLYMERS





PRINCIPLES

## PERMEATION



PRINCIPLES

### PERMEATION



#### PERMEABILITY

gas	M (g·mol⁻¹)	velocity @0°C (m·s <sup>-1</sup> )	velocity @15°C (m·s <sup>-1</sup> )	velocity @25°V (m·s <sup>-1</sup> )
0 <sub>2</sub>	32	425	436	444
N <sub>2</sub>	28	454	467	475
He	4	1202	1256	1256.2
CO <sub>2</sub>	44	363	372	379
H2O	18	567	582	592
Ait	28.8	448	460	461



#### Units of permeability, permeance, and Gas Transmission Rate

		Common Units	St	Fundamental dimension		
Amount of mass	q	g, cm <sup>3</sup> (STP), mol	kg	М	Mass	
Thickness	l	cm/ mil	m	L	Length	
Time	t	h, d	s	θ	Time	
Area	А	cm <sup>2</sup> , in <sup>2</sup>	$m^2$	$L^2$	Length	
Partial pressure	р	atm. psi, mmHg	Pa	F/L <sup>2</sup>	Force/length	



Polymer	Thickness (µm)	P <sub>i</sub> at 25°C	Ep (kcal/mol)
LDPE	18	1.900	10.2
Nylon 6	10	25.0	10.5
PP	20	620	11.5

$$L_{\rm T} = 18 + 10 + 20 = 48 \ \mu m$$
  
$$\sum_{1}^{3} \frac{\ell_{\rm i}}{P_{\rm i}} = \frac{\ell_{\rm i}}{P_{\rm i}} + \frac{\ell_{\rm 2}}{P_{\rm 2}} + \frac{\ell_{\rm 3}}{P_{\rm 3}} = \frac{18}{1900} + \frac{20}{25} + \frac{20}{620} = 0.4417 \frac{{\rm m}^2 \cdot {\rm d} \ {\rm kPa}}{\rm cc}$$
$$P_{\rm T} = \frac{48}{0.4417} = 109 \frac{{\rm cc} \cdot \mu m}{{\rm m}^2 \cdot {\rm d} \cdot {\rm kPa}}$$



Polymer	Permeant	10 <sup>15</sup> Permeability (kg m <sup>-1</sup> kPa <sup>-1</sup> s <sup>-1</sup> )	10 <sup>12</sup> Diffusivity (m <sup>2</sup> s <sup>-1</sup> )	10 <sup>3</sup> Solubility (kg m <sup>-3</sup> kPa <sup>-1</sup> )
PA 6	Nitrogen	0.023	0.025	0.94
PETP	Nitrogen	0.063	0.13	0.48
PVC	Carbon dioxide	0.52	0.21	2.5
PIB	Nitrogen	3.1	4.5	0.69
	Carbon dioxide	77	5.8	13
CR	Nitrogen	11	25	0.44
	Carbon dioxide	300	24	16
NR	Nitrogen	76	110	0.69
	Carbon dioxide	1900	110	18
	n-Propane	2500	21	120
HDPE	Helium (30°C)	1.9	360	0.0055
	Oxygen (30°C)	5.4	22	0.25
	Nitrogen (30°C)	1.7	12	0.14
	Carbon dioxide	31	16	2.0
LDPE	Isobutene (30 <sup>°</sup> C)	680	4.7	140
	n-Hexane (30°C)	6200	2.5	2500
	Water	540	23	24

Permeability of some polymers at  $25^{\circ}$  C

# ADDITIVES

# THERMOPLASTICS, ELASTOMERS



## FOOD APPLICATIONS

French Fries

Innovative Solutions for Packaging

taranan paranan palinan paning manafitana mana pilin pani ang marahas ina aka dara jara pana mini marahasa pani

A APRIL AND APPENDING AND ADDRESS.

## NON FOOD APPLICATIONS

257

TH

Technical function	Example	Use level, wt%, polymer
Antioxidant	Tetrakis[methylene (3,5-di- <i>tert</i> -butyl-4-hydroxyhydrocinnamate)]methane	0.25 (Polystyrene)
	Tris(2,4-di- tert-butylphenyl) phosphite	0.2 (Polyolefins)
Stabilizer	Di( <i>n</i> -octyl)tin <i>S</i> , <i>S</i> '-bis(isooctylmercaptoacetate)	1.5 (PVC)
	Epoxidized soybean oil	6 (PVC)
	Stearoylbenzoylmethane	0.5 (PVC)
	Cuprous iodide	0.01 (Nylon 6,6)
Plasticizer	Di(2-ethylhexyl) phthalate	40 (PVC)
	Di(2-ethylhexyl) adipate	20 (PVC)
	Acetyltributyl citrate	5 (PVDC)
Lubricant	N, N'-Ethylenebisstearamide	1 (PVC)
	Pentaerythritol adipate-stearate	1 (PVC)
Processing agent	Styrene/butadiene/methacrylate copolymer	2 (PVC)
Melt fracture eliminator	Vinylidene fluoride-hexafluoropropylene copolymer	0.1 (Polyethylene)
Slip agent	Fatty acid amides (erucamide, oleamide)	0.2 (Polyolefins)
Antistatic agent	N, N'-Bis (2-hydroxyethyl)alkyl-C <sub>14-18</sub> -amine	0.15 (Polyolefins)
Blowing agent	Azodicarbonamide	0.15 (Polyethylene)
Antiblock agent	Silica, talc	0.2 (Polyethylene)
Impact modifier	Butadiene/styrene/methacrylate copolymers	10 (PVC)
Clarifying agent	Dibenzylidene sorbitol	0.25 (Polyolefins)
Light stabilizer	2-Hydroxy-4-n-octoxybenzophenone	0.5 (Polyolefins)
	Dimethylsuccinate-(4-hydroxy-2,2,6,6-tetra-methyl-1-piperidyl)-ethanol polycondensate	0.25 (Polyolefins)
Coupling agent	3-(triethoxylsilyl)propylamine	0.5 (Nylon 6,6)
Filler, extender	Calcium carbonate, clay, talc	>5 (Various polymers)
Reinforcing agents	Glass, fiber, mica, calcium silicate	>5 (Various polymers)
Colorant	Titanium dioxide, ferric oxide, carbon black, ultramarine blue, phthalo- cyanine blue	0.1–5 (Various polymers)

**Table 16.13**Examples of Processing and Service Aids Used in Food-Packaging Materials

Source: Compiled from FDA (1987) and British Plastics Federation (1980).

# COMMON ADDITIVES AND CONCENTRATION RANGES IN INITIAL MATERIALS

	PE	PP	PS	PVC	PET	PVA	PC	Ероху	PA
Antioxidant	В	В	В	Х					В
Heat stabilizer				B/C		В			
UV stabilizer	B/C	B/C	С	С				С	
Antistatic agent	Х	Х	Х	x	x	x	X		X
Shock agent	x	Х	Х	X	x	x	x		
Initiator			D	D		D			
Catalyst	D	D			D		D		D
Lubricant	Х	Х	Х	Х	Х			X	
Plasticizer	А		А	А		А			
Charges	А	Α	Α	Α	Α	А	Α	А	Α

A >10 000 mg·kg<sup>-1</sup> – B = 100-5000 mg·kg<sup>-1</sup> – C = 100-500 mg·kg<sup>-1</sup> D = 1-100 mg·kg<sup>-1</sup> – E < 1 mg·kg<sup>-1</sup>, x ou X variable amounts (with x>X),

nom	CAS Formule M (g∙mo[¹)	Structure 3D	nom	CAS Formule M (g∙mo[¹)	Structure 3D
2,6-Di(tert- butyl)hydroxytoluène (BHT)	128-37-0 C15 H24 O 220.35	ž.	Acide 3-(1,1- diméthyléthyl)-4- hydroxy-5-méthyl- Benzènepropanoïque (Irganox 245)	36443-68-2 C34 H50 O8 586.76	and the state of t
Monoacrylate de 2,2'- Méthylenebis(4-méthyl- 6-tert-butylphénol) Irganox (3052)	61167-58-6 C26 H34 O3 394.55		4,4',4"-[(2,4,6- triméthyl-1,3,5- benzènetriyl)tris(méthy lène)]tris[2,6-bis(1,1- diméthyléthyl)-phénol (Irganox 1330)	1709-70-2 C54 H78 O3 775.20	
2-méthyl-4,6- bis[(octylthio)méthyl]- phénol (Irganox 1520)	110553-27- 0 C25 H44 O S2 424.75	naga taninga	Isocyanurate de s- Triazine- 2,4,6(1H,3H,5H)-trione, 1,3,5-tris(3,5-di-tert- butyl-4-hydroxybenzyl)- (8CI); 1,3,5-Tri(3,5-di- tert-butyl-4- hydroxybenzyle) (Irganox 3114)	27676-62-6 C48 H69 N3 O6 784.08	
3,4-dihydro-2,5,7,8- tetraméthyl-2-(4,8,12- triméthyltridecyl)- 2H-1- Benzopyran-6-ol (Irganox 231)	59-02-9 C29 H50 O2 430.71	A HANNER	Benzène propanoate de 3,5-bis(1,1- diméthyléthyl)-4- hydroxy-, 1,1'-[2,2- bis[[3-[3,5-bis(1,1- diméthyléthyl)-4- hydroxyphényl]-1- oxopropoxy]méthyl]- 1,3-propanediyle] (Irganox 1010)	6683-19-8 C73 H108 O12 1177.63	
1,1-Bis(3,5-di-tert-butyl- 2- hydroxyphényl)éthane (Isonox 129)	35958-30-6 C30 H46 O2 438.68		bis[2,4-bis(1,1- diméthyléthyl)-6- méthylphényl] éthyl ester (Irgafos 38)	145650-60-8 C32 H51 O3 P 514.72	and the second sec
2,6-Di-tert-butyl-4- (octadécanoxycarbonylé thyl)phénol (Irganox 1076)	2082-79-3 C35 H62 O3 530.86		2,4,8,10-Tetraoxa-3,9- diphosphaspiro[5.5]un décane, 3,9-bis[2,4- bis(1,1- diméthyléthyl)phénoxy ]- (Ultranox 626,640)	26741-53-7 C33 H50 O6 P2 604.69	and the
Propionate de 3, 3'- thiobis-, didodécyle (Irganox 800)	123-28-4 C30 H58 O4 S 544	**************************************	Diphosphite de Bis(2,6- di-tert-butyl-4- méthylphényl)pentaéry thritol (Mark PEP 36)	80693-00-1 C35 H54 O6 P2 632.75	
3,5-bis-(1, 1- diméthyléthyl)-4- hydroxynenzène propionate d'hydrazine (Irganox 1024)	32687-78-8 C34 H52 N2 O4 552.79		1,1',1''- Phosphite de 2,4-bis(1,1- diméthyléthyl)-Phénol (Irgafos 168)	31570-04-4 C42 H63 O3 P 646.92	



The 2,6-ditert-butyl-4-<u>hydroxytoluene</u> (BHT, B12<u>1</u>) is the simplest phenolic antioxidant. It yields a stable phenoxy radical i) by mesomery, ii) steric effect due to large tert-butyl, and iii) captodative effect.

nom	CAS Formule M (g∙mol <sup>-1</sup> )	Structure 3D	nom	CAS Formule M (g∙moΓ¹)	Structure 3D
Acide 4H-1-	248595-13- 3	. 2 2	Adipate de Di(2-	103-23-1	3
Benzopyran-2-	C18 H20 O5	A CAR	éthylhexyle (DEHA)	C22H42O4	
curboxynque	316.35			370.57	2
4-	6160-78-7	8		77-90-7	1 1.56
Methylumbelliferyl- beta-D-	C16H18O8		Citrate de tributyl- acétyle	C20 H34 O8	S.S.S.
galactopyranoside	338.31		accivic	402.88	
2-	117-81-7	200 C			
diéthylhexyl)phtalat	C24H38O4				
(DEHP)	390.56				
PLASTICIZE Potence Period	TIALLYAN CRINIANS RUPTORS		CINGEI	Marine Color	
		A B	noa		

Conra	d et al.	(2004	4)	
		na Ashi	N MART	
- Hard		Sector 1	-	
0	0.25	0.5	1.0	

test containers with red drink after three days of UV exposure.

Carbon black
PM 42080

#### Benzo[a]pyrene, carcinogenic impurity (< 0,25 mg/kg C)

specifications for the HAP

ANTIUV



	nom	CAS Formule M (g∙moΓ¹)	Structure 3D	nom	CAS Formule M (g∙mo[¹)	Structure 3D
-	2-Hydroxy-4- methoxybenzophénone (Chimassorb 90)	131-57-7 C14 H12 O3 228.24		Acide 3,5-bis(1,1- diméthyléthyl)-4-hydroxy- benzoïque (Cyasorb 2908)	67845- 93-6 C31 H54 O3 474.76	Strawww.
-	1-(2-Hydroxyéthyl)- 2,2,6,6-tetraméthyl-4- hydroxypiperidine (Tinuvin 622)	52722-86-8 C11 H23 N O2 201.31		Décanoate de 1,10-bis(2,2,6,6- tetraméthyl-4-pipéridinyle) (Tinuvin 770)	52829- 07-9 C28 H52 N2 O4 480.72	× marga
k	2-(5-chloro-2H- benzotriazol-2-yl)-6- (1,1-diméthyléthyl)-4- méthyl-Phénol (Tinuvin 326)	3896-11-5 C17 H18 Cl N3 O 315.80	~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~	Didécanoate de 1,10- bis(1,2,2,6,6-pentaméthyl-4- piperidinyle) (Tinuvin 292)	41556- 26-7 C30 H56 N2 O4 508.78	A CONTRACTOR
- C	2-(2H-benzotriazol-2- yl)-4,6-bis(1,1- diméthyléthyl)-Phénol (Tinuvin 320)	3846-71-7 C20 H25 N3 O 323.43		Poly[[6-[(1,1,3,3- tetraméthylbutyl)amino]-1,3,5- triazine-2,4-diyl][(2,2,6,6- tetraméthyl-4- piperidinyl)imino]-1,6- hexanediyl[(2,2,6,6-tetraméthyl- 4-piperidinyl)imino]] (Chimassorb 944)	71878- 19-8 (C35 H66 N8)n n∙598.96	
	2-hydroxy-4-(octyloxy)- (6Cl,8Cl); 2-Benzoyl-5- octyloxyphénol benzophénone (Chimassorb 81)	1843-05-6 C21 H26 O3 326.43	A LAND AND AND AND AND AND AND AND AND AND	Didécanoate de 1,10-bis[2,2,6,6- tetraméthyl-1-(octyloxy)-4- piperidinyle] (Tinuvin 123)	122586- 52-1 C44 H84 N2 O6 737.15	04 0.72 56- 5-7 H56 04 3.78 378- 3-8 5 H66 B)n 38.96 586- 2-1 H84 06 7.15 990- 3-6 132 250 32 55.61
_	2,2'-(2,5- thiophénediyl)bis[5- (1,1-diméthyléthyl)- Benzoxazole (Uvitex OB55)	7128-64-5 C26 H26 N2 O2 S 430.56		N2,N2'-1,2-ethanediylbis[N2-[3- [[4,6-bis[butyl(1,2,2,6,6- pentaméthyl-4- piperidinyl)amino]-1,3,5-triazin- 2-yl]amino]propyl]-N4,N6- dibutyl-N4,N6-bis(1,2,2,6,6- pentaméthyl-4-piperidinyl)- 1,3,5-Triazine-2,4,6-triamine (Chimassorb 119)	106990- 43-6 C132 H250 N32 2285.61	
	2-(3'-tert-Butyl-2'- hydroxy-5'-(2- octyloxycarbonyléthyl)p hényl)benzotriazole (Tinuvin 99)	84268-23-5 C27 H37 N3 O3 451.60	Contraction of the second			



# **MIGRATION ISSUES**

PAST CRISES, DIFFUSION-SOLUBILIZATION, REGULATION













OPEN

## http://ec.europa.eu/food/food/rapidalert/index\_en.htm



Site Map | What's New | A to Z Index | Contact | English (en)

#### European Food Commission



#### **Rapid Alert System for Food and Feed**



What's New?

- 😱 Rapid Alert System for Food and Feed (R
- Press release on 2012 RASFF annual rep
- Questions and answers on 2012 RASFF

#### Welcome to the RASFF porta

The Rapid Alert System for Food and Feed (R exchange information about measures take information helps Member States to act mor feed.

- Read more about the legal basis of RASF
- Who are the members of RASFF?
- ᠾ RASFF Keeping an eye on your food 嵟

The effectiveness of RASFF is ensured by kee Commission, EFSA, EFTA surveillance authorit structured way by means of templates.

# **RASFF** Portal

Se	arch criteria	Subj	ect *Thioxa	ANTHONE*	Product	type food contact material   Hazard category migration					
an	ui unuena p			X 🕅							
<< First << << Previous 100 << Notifications <b>1 to 9</b> of 9 >> Next 100 >> >> Last >>											
	Classification	Date of case	Last change	Reference	Country	Subject	Product Category	Туре			
	information for attention	10/03/2011	16/03/2011	<u>2011.0316</u>	DE	migration of 2-methyl-4'-(methylthio)-2-morpholinopropiophenone, of ethyl-4-dimethylaminobenzoate and of 2.4-diethyl thioxanthone (DETX) (sum 685 µg/kg - ppb) from printing ink on drinking cups from Germany	food contact materials	FCM	9		
	information for follow-up	21/01/2011	14/03/2011	2011.0088	DE	migration of 2-methyl-4'-(methylthio)-2-morpholinopropiophenone (54 µg/kg - ppb) and of 2.4-diethyl thioxanthone (DETX) (91 µg/kg - ppb) from plastic mugs from Greece	food contact materials	FCM	C		
	information for attention	11/02/2011	10/03/2011	<u>2011.0175</u>	DE	migration of 2-methyl-4-(methylthio)-2-morpholinopropiophenone, of ethyl-4-dimethylaminobenzoate and of 2.4-diethyl thioxanthone (DETX) (sum = 160) from printing on plastic cups from Germany	food contact materials	FCM	2		
	information	21/12/2010	10/03/201		migration of 2-methyl-4-(methylthio)-2-morpholinopropiophenone (simulant of 10% ethanol- 86 un/kg - nnh) of ethyl-4- Notification detail - 2011.0316						
	information	18/03/2010	10/03/201	migrat	migration of 2-methyl-4'-(methylthio)-2-morpholinopropiophenone, of ethyl-4-dimethylaminobenzoate and of 2.4- diethyl thioxanthone (DETX) (sum 685 µg/kg - ppb) from printing ink on drinking cups from Germany						
	alert	31/07/2009	10/03/201		Reference : 2011.0316   Notification date : 10/03/2011   Last update : 16/03/2011						
	information	11/04/2006	02/02/200		Action taken • withdrawal from the market						
	alert	17/01/2006	02/02/200	Notification from : Germany (DE)					Q		
	alert	17/01/2006	02/02/200		Distributio	n status: distribution restricted to notifying country Product: printing ink on drinking cups rategory: food contact materials	RAS	FF	0		

Hazards :

#### Substance / Hazard Category Analytical result Units Sampling date migration of 2-methyl-4'-(methylthio)-2migration morpholinopropiophenone migration of 2.4-diethyl migration sum 685 µg/kg - ppb thioxanthone (DETX) migration of ethyl-4-dimethylaminobenzoate migration 16/10/2010





2018 figures




# BISPHENOLS



## **EPOXIDE=reactive migrants**





### SCREENING OF MIGRANTS FROM CAN COATINGS <1000 Da SAMPLE: STANDARD EPOXY-COATING, MECN-EXTRACT





## Bisphenol A Exposure Causes Meiotic Aneuploidy in the Female Mouse

Background: There is increasing concern that exposure to man-made substances that mimic endogenous hormones may adversely affect mammalian reproduction. Although a variety of reproductive complications have been ascribed to compounds with androgenic or estrogenic properties, little attention has been directed at the potential consequences of such exposures to the genetic quality of the gamete.

Results: A sudden, spontaneous increase in meiotic disturbances, including aneuploidy, in studies of oocytes from control female mice in our laboratory coincided with the accidental exposure of our animals to an environmental source of bisphenol A (BPA). BPA is an estrogenic compound widely used in the production of polycarbonate plastics and epoxy resins. We identified damaged caging material as the source of the exposure, as we were able to recapitulate the meiotic abnormalities by intentionally damaging cages and water bottles. In subsequent studies of female mice, we administered daily oral doses of BPA to directly test the hypothesis that low levels of BPA disrupt female meiosis. Our results demonstrated that the meiotic effects were dose dependent and could be induced by environmentally relevant doses of BPA.



Conclusions: Both the initial inadvertent exposure and subsequent experimental studies suggest that BPA is a potent meiotic aneugen. Specifically, in the female mouse, short-term, low-dose exposure during the final stages of oocyte growth is sufficient to elicit detectable meiotic effects. These results provide the first unequivocal link between mammalian meiotic aneuploidy and an accidental environmental exposure and suggest that the oocyte and its meiotic spindle will provide a sensitive assay system for the study of reproductive toxins.



## PRESENCE IN FOOD







Source: Chemical analyses of 97 canned foods by Southern Testing and Research Division of Microbac Laboratories, Inc., North Carolina

## **Google Trends – 2003-present**



Termes associés 🛛 🔞	Les plus fr	En progre
bpa bisphenol a	100	
bpa	95	
bisphenol a bottles	60	
bisphenol a plastic	55	
bisphenol a biberon	55	
biberon bisphenol	50	
sans bisphenol a	50	
biberon sans bisphenol	40	
bisphenol a free	35	
bisphenol a baby	35	

## Epilogue



Actualité | Photos | Vidéos | Blogs | Express Yourself | Tendances | Elysée 2012

À la une | Politique | Monde | Economie | Société | Education | Médias | High-Tech | Sport | Sciences et si

Actualité > Politique

#### L'Assemblée unanime interdit les contenants alimentaires avec du bisphénol A

publié le 12/10/2011 à 17:11, mis à jour à 19:23



afp.com/Mychèle Daniau

PARIS - A l'unanimité, l'Assemblée a voté mercredi l'interdiction du bisphénol A dans les contenants alimentaires, objet d'une proposition de loi socialiste soutenue par le gouvernement.

La mesure s'appliquera à compter de 2014, mais dès 2013 pour les contenants alimentaires de produits destinés aux enfants de moins de 3 ans, conformément à un amendement introduit par le ministre de la Santé, Xavier Bertrand, lors des débats jeudi dernier.

Le bisphénol A, composant chimique très répandu dans les objets de la

#### Toutes les dépêches

CAN: le Soudan qualifié, carton plein de la Côte d'Ivoire dans le groupe B

Wall Street finit en légère baisse: Dow Jones -0,05%, Nasdaq -0,16%



Mercredi 26 décembre 2012 / N° 300

LOI no 2012-1442 du 24 décembre 2012 visant à la suspension de la fabrication, de l'importation, de l'exportation et de la mise sur le marché de tout conditionnement à vocation alimentaire contenant du bisphénol A.

- « Cette suspension prend effet, dans les mêmes conditions, au **1er janvier 2015** pour **tout autre conditionnement, contenant ou ustensile comportant du bisphénol A et destiné à entrer en contact direct avec des denrées alimentaires.**
- « Avant le 1er juillet 2014, le Gouvernement remet au Parlement un rapport évaluant les substituts possibles au bisphénol A pour ses applications industrielles au regard de leur éventuelle toxicité.

Food and Feed borne crises throughout the food chain





destroy consumer's confidence in food

# But what about food packaging







# PHOTOINITIATORS





Italian police seize contaminated Nestle baby milk 22 Nov 2005 16:45:09 GMT

Source: Reuters



#### PREVIOUS | NEXT >

Forest Ranger officials check a package of baby milk made by Swiss food group Nestle in a supermarket in Italy November 22, 2005. Italian police seized around 30 million litres of baby milk produced by Nestle on Tuesday after tests showed traces of ink, and the company said it was recalling the infant food in four European countries. REUTERS/HO

AlertNet

♠

**REUTERS** FOUNDATION (Adds Tetra Pak comment in paragraph 11)

By Massimiliano Di Giorgio and Isabel Strassheim

ROME/ZURICH, Nov 22 (Reuters) -Italian police seized around 30 million litres of baby milk produced by Swiss food giant Nestle <NESN.VX> on Tuesday after tests showed it was contaminated with traces of ink used in the packaging.

Nestle said the chemical substance was not harmful, but announced it was recalling the infant food in four European countries, including Italy, because of the problem, which related to Tetra Pak cartons.

Italian Agriculture Minister Gianni Alemanno demanded tests to see if babies given the contaminated milk over a prolonged period faced health risks.

"It is incredible that such defenceless

beings as babies should face such serious risks in a product as widely used as milk," Alemanno said in a statement.

Italian officials said they had already seized about 2 million litres of Nestle baby milk earlier this month after finding traces of isopropylthioxanthone (ITX), an ink component used in the offset printing process of the Tetra Pak cartons.

They broadened their net on Tuesday, sweeping hundreds of packets of milk off supermarket shelves and out of depots around Italy. Police said they also searched lorries in their effort to root out the four Nestle products under investigation.

Nestle, the world's biggest food company, said it had decided to recall all liquid infant formula milks packed in offset printed cartons in Italy, France, Spain and Portugal. "It is incredible that such defenceless beings as babies should face such serious risks in a product as widely used as milk"



#### BOTTOM LINE SAFE

A spokesman at Nestle's corporate headquarters in Switzerland said a new packaging process had been put in place to prevent the contamination and that the recall would not have a significant impact on the company's results at a group level.

Nestle shares were down 0.5 percent at 1615 GMT in a slightly higher overall Swiss market.

Tetra Pak spokeswoman Patricia O'Hayer said ITX was not recognised as a toxic substance on any official list and was not on the World Health Organisation lists of toxic substances that should not come into contact with food.

"We have studied the toxicological data available, and that confirms that it is not toxic," she told Reuters.

O'Hayer said Tetra Pak removed the printing technology in question in October to prevent any printing compound, even if not dangerous, from seeping into a product.

"We had no indication that this was in any way a cause for concern," she said.

This is the second time Nestle has run foul of Italian authorities this year.

In October, Italy's antitrust authority fined seven producers of baby formula including Nestle a total of 9.743 million euros for running a cartel in Italy to keep prices much higher than in many European countries.

AlertNet news is provided by REUTERS





isopropyl thioxanthone

photoinitiator used in UV, curing resins, inks, coatings and adhesives M=241 g·mol<sup>-1</sup>













December 15, 2005

#### DETAILS EMERGE IN TAINTED NESTLÉ FORMULA SCANDAL

The discovery of contamination in various Nestlé baby food brands has caused a huge stir in Europe. Millions of litres of formula have been pulled from the shelves and a top official in the Italian government has threatened legal action against the corporation's CEO. It is now clear that the contamination was caused by IsopropilThioxanthone (ITX), a fixative of printing ink used on liquid milk cartons (produced by TetraPack, a large company that serves many other food companies for different kinds of foods and beverages). It is also apparent that Nestlé has been less than responsible is recalling potentially contaminated baby formula, prompting government intervention and seizures of the product. This episode demonstrates yet again Nestlé's willingness to preserve its own profits at the expense of infant health, and the inherent dangers presented by mass-produced baby food.

July 2005: First tests of Nestlé ready-to-feed liquid formula in the Marche region of Italy show contamination by ITX. Further tests were ordered on other Nestlé products: Nidina 1 for infants, Nidina 2 for babies 6 to 12 months, Latte Mio and Mio Cereali for children 1 to 3 years.





#### Italian police seize contaminated Nestle baby milk 22 Nov 2005 16:45:09 GMT Source: Reuters



PREVIOUS | NEXT >

est Ranger officials check a package aby milk made by Swiss food group tle in a supermarket in Italy rember 22, 2005. Italian police

seized around 30 million litres of baby milk produced by Nestle on Tuesday after tests showed traces of ink, and the company said it was recalling the infant food in four European countries. REUTERS/HO (Adds Tetra Pak comment in paragraph 11)

By Massimiliano Di Giorgio and Isabel Strassheim

ROME/ZURICH, Nov 22 (Reuters) -Italian police seized around 30 million litres of baby milk produced by Swiss food giant Nestle <NESN.VX> on Tuesday after tests showed it was contaminated with traces of ink used in the packaging.

Nestle said the chemical substance was not harmful, but announced it was recalling the infant food in four European countries, including Italy, because of the problem, which related to Tetra Pak cartons.

Italian Agriculture Minister Gianni Alemanno demanded tests to see if babies given the contaminated milk over a prolonged period faced health risks.

"It is incredible that such defenceless

beings as babies should face such serious risks in a product as widely used as milk," Alemanno said in a statement.

Italian officials said they had already seized about 2 million litres of Nestle baby milk earlier this month after finding traces of isopropylthioxanthone (ITX), an ink component used in the offset printing process of the Tetra Pak cartons.

They broadened their net on Tuesday, sweeping hundreds of packets of milk off supermarket shelves and out of depots around Italy. Police said they also searched lorries in their effort to root out the four Nestle products under investigation.



**SCIENCE & IMPACT** 

Nestle, the world's biggest food company, said it had decided to recall all liquid infant formula milks packed in offset printed cartons in Italy, France, Spain and Portugal. "It is incredible that such defenseless beings as babies should face such serious risks in a product as widely used as milk"



### Modeling would have been able to predict ITX values in food $\sim$

.Food Additives and Contaminants Part a-Chemistry Analysis Control Exposure & Risk Assessment, 2009, 26(12), 1556-1573.

	Migrant Homologous migrant <sup>†</sup> Polymer	2-ITX not available LDPE <sup>††</sup>
PARAMETER	notation (unit)	
Thickness	I <sub>P</sub> (μm)	50
Volume dilution ratio	L <sub>F/P</sub> (-)	360
Biot mass number	Bi (-)	10 <sup>3</sup>
Contact Time	t (days)	90
Temperature	(°C)	4
Likely initial concentration <sup>a</sup>	$\overline{C}^{\scriptscriptstyle 0}_{i,P}$ a (mg·kg-1)	100 ± 10
Conservative initial concentration <sup>b</sup>	$\left(C^{0}_{i,P} ight)^{+}$ b (mg·kg <sup>-1</sup> )	300
Likely diffusion coefficient	$\overline{D}_{i,P}$ °(m <sup>2</sup> .s <sup>-1</sup> )	8.4·10 <sup>-16</sup> [7.6·10 <sup>-16</sup> 9.2·10 <sup>-16</sup> ]
Conservative diffusion coefficient <sup>d</sup>	$D_{i,P}^{+}$ d (m <sup>2</sup> .s <sup>-1</sup> )	3.9·10 <sup>-14</sup>
Likely partition coefficient <sup>e</sup>	$\overline{K}_{i,F/P}$ (-)	1.4·10 <sup>-9</sup> [3.7·10 <sup>-10</sup> 5.1·10 <sup>-9</sup> ]
Conservative partition coefficient	$K^{\scriptscriptstyle +}_{i,F/P}$ (-)	10 <sup>3</sup>

Last

change

Reference

2005.631

Country

ITALY



**RASFF** Portal

Date of

case 6. 08/09/2005

migration of isopropyl thioxanthone (250  $\mu$ g/l) from packaging of milk for babies from Spain

## IS FOOD PACKAG



4-methyl benzophenone

#### LE VEILLEUR@

Quelques fois on ne voit pas tout..

🕆 🔿 Contact

Accueil > Actu, France > Lidl a rappelé des milliers de boîtes de céréales en février

#### Lidl a rappelé des milliers de boîtes de céréales en février

02/04/2009

🦙 Allez aux commentaires 🛛 🧠 Commenter



Des milliers de paquets de céréales pour le petit déjeuner "muësli" ont été retirés en février des rayons des 1 400 magasins Lidl de France, suite à la contamination de ces céréales par une composante toxique utilisée dans l'encre des emballages, indique, jeudi 2 avril, Lidl.

"Nous avons été informés le 6 février par notre maison-mère qu'il fallait retirer de la vente deux références, des muesli au chocolat et des muesli aux fruits. Les marchandises ont été retirées le 9 février", déclare Jérôme Gresland, directeur des achats de Lidl pour la France, confirmant une information du Canard enchaîné. Des sites comme 60 millions de consommateurs ou rappelsproduits.fr permettent aux

consommateurs s'informer sur les produits – steaks hachés avariés, circuits hydrauliques de voiture défectueux, saucisson contenant des salmonelles – rappelés par les constructeurs et fabricants.

Le signalement de la maison-mère était consécutif à une alerte du système d'alerte européen pour les denrées alimentaires (RASFF), après qu'un contrôle sanitaire a mis en évidence en Allemagne la présence de 4-méthyle benzophénone (4-MBP) dans des céréales, a précisé M. Gresland. L'EFSA a fait savoir le 4 mars que "la consommation régulière de produits fortement contaminés" par la molécule incriminée pouvait présenter "dans des cas extrêmes un risque pour certains enfants". La branche française de Lidl a décidé de son propre chef de retirer les produits de ses rayons, "par précaution", a souligné M. Gresland.

"A aucun moment la Direction générale de la concurrence, de la consommation, et de la répression des fraudes (DGCCRF) ne nous a demandé de procéder à un rappel des produits" déjà vendus, a-t-il dit. "La DGCCRF a pris contact avec nous début mars, trois semaines après le retrait des produits de la vente", a-t-il.







## MINERAL OILS



## **Coupled mass transfer**

between the food product and the packaging material





### **CONTEXT: EXAMPLES NOT COVERED BY SPECIFIC MEASURES:** NON-SPECIFICALLY REGULATED MATERIALS, DRY AND AQUEOUS FOOD FALSELY CONSIDERED SAFE

#### CONTAMINATION OF NODDLES BY RECYCLED FIBERS OF SECONDARY PACKAGING

After 65 days of contact, 6.1 mg/kg of paraffins found in noodles stored in boxes in top and bottom positions. Estimated migration at shelf life (2 years) : 10 mg/kg

(Biedermann et al., 2011; Packaging Technol & Sci 2011, 24, 281-290)



### CONTAMINATION OF FRESH FRUITS BY PRINTED TABLE NAPKIN

Migration of o-anisidine (primary aromatic amine): printed paper 17.5  $\mu$ g/l  $\rightarrow$  kiwi: 5.3  $\mu$ g/l (migration rate: 17 %) (Helling, 2011)





## MOH SURVEY

FOOD WATCH – October 2015

#### SOURCES DE CONTAMINATION DES ALIMENTS PAR LES HUILES MINÉRALES





http://www.foodwatch.org/fr/presse/communiques-de-presse/page-detailcommuniques-de-presse/des-hydrocarbures-dans-nos-assiettesfoodwatch-tire-le-signal-dalarme/





Ubiquécous coréaminanés Mineral Oils, Prinéing inks, adhesires



## • **PRINTING INKS** (EUPIA guidelines to be revised)

Exclusion/Negative lists



- Purity/traceability requiremative
- Migration (less than 10 ppb for non evaluated substances) and risk assessments
- Inks prepared according to GMP
- No-direct contact with food
- No "visible' Set-off in stacks and reels





## • MINERAL OILS

- No recycled paper or paperboard
- No MOSH below C20, migration <2 ppm for C20-C35
- Migration of MOAH (C16-C35)<0.5 ppm
- List of raw materials and production aids
- No holding/reheating above 90°C
- No microwave uses
- With internal bag

#### **PARTITION COEFFICIENTS WITH WATER/ETHANOL** NF AND



Ind. Eng. Chem. Res. 2010, 49(16), 7263-7280.

CIENCE & IMPACT

01/04/2020

## MODELING WOULD HAVE BEEN ABLE TO PREDICT ITX VALUES IN FOOD

.Food Additives and Contaminants Part a-Chemistry Analysis Control Exposure & Risk Assessment, 2009, 26(12), 1556-1573.

	Migrant Homologous migrant¹ Polymer	2-ITX not available LDPE <sup>††</sup>
PARAMETER	notation (unit)	
Thickness	I <sub>P</sub> (μm)	50
Volume dilution ratio	L <sub>F/P</sub> (-)	360
Biot mass number	Bi (-)	10 <sup>3</sup>
Contact Time	t (days)	90
Temperature	(°C)	4
Likely initial concentration <sup>a</sup>	$\overline{C}_{i,P}^{\circ}$ a (mg·kg-1)	100 ± 10
Conservative initial concentration <sup>b</sup>	$\left(C^{0}_{i,P} ight)^{+}$ b (mg·kg <sup>-1</sup> )	300
Likely diffusion coefficient	$\overline{D}_{i,P}$ °(m <sup>2</sup> .s <sup>-1</sup> )	8.4·10 <sup>-16</sup> [7.6·10 <sup>-16</sup> 9.2·10 <sup>-16</sup> ]
Conservative diffusion coefficient <sup>d</sup>	$D_{i,P}^{+}$ d (m <sup>2</sup> .s <sup>-1</sup> )	3.9·10 <sup>-14</sup>
Likely partition coefficient <sup>e</sup>	$\overline{K}_{i,F/P}$ (-)	1.4·10 <sup>-9</sup> [3.7·10 <sup>-10</sup> 5.1·10 <sup>-9</sup> ]
Conservative partition coefficient	$K^{\scriptscriptstyle +}_{i,F/P}$ (-)	10 <sup>3</sup>

Last

change

Reference

Date of

case



 6. 08/09/2005
 2005.631
 ITALY
 food contact materials

 RASFF Portal
 migration of isopropyl thioxanthone (250 μg/l) from packaging of milk for babies from Spain

Country

## **PREDICTIONS vs EXPERIMENTS**



## **TWO EXTREME CASES**



## **AMBIENT TEMPERATURES**

Nguyen et al. 2016, submitted to FAC



https://github.com/ovitrac/FMECAengine

### ISO-MIGRATION: TIME x TEMPERATURE x M ISO-TIME: CONTAMINATION x TEMPERATURE x M



.0102

## TOXICITY

ACUTE TOXICITY vs NEW TRENDS



"Truth in science can be defined as the working hypothesis best suited to open the way to the next better one."—Konrad Lorenz, Austria



#### theguardian

News Sport Comment Culture Business Money Life & style Travel Environment

#### News World news Food safety

#### Chemicals leaching into food from packaging raise safety concerns

Scientists, in BMJ paper, warn of potential long-term damage of exposure to synthetics, including formaldehyde in drinks bottles

Sarah Boseley, health editor The Guardian, Wednesday 19 February 2014 Jump to comments (449)



Packaged burger and chips. Synthetic chemicals in packaging include phthalates, known to disrupt hormone production. Photograph: Martin Godwin for the Guardian

Synthetic chemicals which are used in the processing, packaging and storing of the food we eat could be doing long-term damage to our health, environmental scientists warn.

The concerns have been raised in the Journal of Epidemiology and Community Health, part of the British Medical Journal group.

The scientists claim that tiny amounts of synthetic chemicals leach into food. While these minute quantities in themselves do no harm, no one knows how safe we are from a lifetime's exposure to the chemicals, such as formaldehyde, through eating food previously wrapped or stored in plastics.

In a commentary piece in the journal the scientists note that some of the chemicals that could cause concern are regulated but this does not prevent their being used widely in food packaging. They say that people who eat packaged or processed foods are likely to be chronically exposed to low levels of these substances throughout their lives.

Far too little is known about the long-term impact and especially about our exposure to such chemicals at critical points in human development, such as in the womb and during early childhood.

Share (9786 Tweet 603 8+1 73 Pinit 18 in Share < 78 Email

I C g Article history

World news Food safety

Business

Science

Society

Diabetes

**UK news** 

Environment Pollution - Plastic bags

More news

More on this story

China's toxic air

scientists

UK

pollution resembles

photosynthesis and potentially wreaking

havoc on country's food

Air pollution: European commission launches

legal action against the

Air pollution: how big a

problem is it for

supply, experts warn

nuclear winter, say

Air pollution now impeding

Health · Cancer

Food & drink industry

Food science · Chemistry



OP/ED 8/20/2013 @ 8:00AM | 13,109 views



main and the second sec

FOLLOW

I write about the science and politics of health ricke full bio ---

We have become accustomed to a steady barrage of reports of hazards lurking in our environment that MAY pose a threat our health and that of our children.

These include, among others, low-level radiation exposure from nuclear power plants and nuclear waste; possible water contamination from hydraulic fracturing; and exposure to a wide range of chemicals, including pesticides and industrial pollutants, in food, water, air, and consumer products.

Much that is published in scientific journals is of astonishingly poor quality.

Potential hazards like these need to be studied and will be studied, but the public needs to realize that much that is published in scientific journals, and even in reputable journals, can be of astonishingly poor quality and is of absolutely no relevance to nonresearchers. But, far from these papers being ignored, they often get seized on by the media and high-lighted as if they provided serious, actionable evidence of a hazard.

How can this happen? How do mediocre or plain-wrong studies get accepted for publication in scientific journals? In essence the explanation is simple. Scientists and scientists-in-training need to find questions to work on and need to publish their results in order to put themselves on the map and to advance in their careers. Journals want to publish articles on topics that appear to be important and that will engage readers.

A CONFERENCES AND MORE





Google" Custor





## ACUTE TOXICOLOGY





Figure 3 : Equilibre entre effets prolifératifs et pro-apoptotiques selon la dose


### Hormones and Endocrine-Disrupting Chemicals: Low-Dose Effects and Nonmonotonic Dose Responses

Laura N. Vandenberg, Theo Colborn, Tyrone B. Hayes, Jerrold J. Heindel, David R. Jacobs, Jr., Duk-Hee Lee, Toshi Shioda, Ana M. Soto, Frederick S. vom Saal, Wade V. Welshons, R. Thomas Zoeller, and John Peterson Myers

Center for Regenerative and Developmental Biology and Department of Biology (L.N.V.), Tufts University, Medford, Massachusetts 02155; The Endocrine Disruption Exchange (T.C.), Paonia, Colorado 81428; Laboratory for Integrative Studies in Amphibian Biology (T.B.H.), Molecular Toxicology, Group in Endocrinology, Energy and Resources Group, Museum of Vertebrate Zoology, and Department of Integrative Biology, University of California, Berkeley, California 94720; Division of Extramural Research and Training (J.J.H.), National Institute of Environmental Health Sciences, National Institutes of Health, U.S. Department of Health and Human Services, Research Triangle Park, North Carolina 27709; Division of Epidemiology and Community Health (D.R.J.), School of Public Health, University of Minnesota, Minneapolis, Minnesota 55455; Department of Preventive Medicine (D.-H.L.), School of Medicine, Kyungpook National University, Daegu 702-701, Korea; Molecular Profiling Laboratory (T.S.), Massachusetts General Hospital Center for Cancer Research, Charlestown, Massachusetts 02129; Department of Anatomy and Cellular Biology (A.M.S.), Tufts University School of Medicine, Boston, Massachusetts 02111; Division of Biological Sciences (F.S.v.S.) and Department of Biomedical Sciences (W.V.W.), University of Missouri-Columbia, Columbia, Missouri 65211; Biology Department (T.Z.), University of Massachusetts-Amherst, Amherst, Massachusetts 01003; and Environmental Health Sciences (J.P.M.), Charlottesville, Virginia 22902

### TABLE 1. Low-dose definitions and cutoff doses: BPA and DEHP as examples

Chemical	Estimated range of human exposures	Doses below the NOAEL	Doses below the LOAEL	Administered doses (to animals) that produce blood levels in typical humans
BPA	0.4−5 µg/kg · d (679)	No NOAEL was ever established in toxicological studies (38)	<50 mg/kg ⋅ d (38)	~400 µg/kg · d to rodents and nonhuman primates (4, 253)
DEHP	0.5–25 µg/kg ⋅ d (680)	<5.8 mg/kg · d (681, 682)	<29 mg/kg ⋅ d (681, 682)	Unknown

Estimates of human exposure are made from consumer product consumption data but do not take into account that there are unknown sources of these chemicals. DEHP, Bis(2-ethylhexyl) phthalate.

### Endocrine Reviews, 2012, 33(3):378-455

# • LOW-DOSE EFFECT SUBSTANCES

### Hormones and Endocrine-Disrupting Chemicals: Low-Dose Effects and Nonmonotonic Dose Responses

Laura N. Vandenberg, Theo Colborn, Tyrone B. Hayes, Jerrold J. Heindel, David R. Jacobs, Jr., Duk-Hee Lee, Toshi Shioda, Ana M. Soto, Frederick S. vom Saal, Wade V. Welshons, R. Thomas Zoeller, and John Peterson Myers

\_

Center for Regenerate and Developmental Biology and Department of Biology (LN V). Tuffs University, Meditord, Misoachustes US (25): The Endocrine Despution Enchanger (2-). Apanic, Calchael 84/28, Liaboratory for Integrative Studies in Amphibian Biology (18 HJ), Melecular Toracleopy, Group in Endocrinology, Energy and Resource Group, Division of Estamunal Research and Training (LJH.), National Institute of Environmental Health Sciences, National Institutes of Health (JJ. Speatrimert of Health and Health Sciences, National Activity, California, Berley, School & Hedicine, Berley, California, California, California, Califo

### TABLE 4. Select examples of EDCs whose potential low-dose effects on animals remain to be studied

Chemical	Use	EDC action	Low-dose cutoff
Antiseptics and preservatives			
Butyl paraben Propyl paraben	Preservative (cosmetics) Antimicrobial preservative found in pharmaceuticals, foods, cosmetics, and shampoos	Estrogenic, antiandrogenic Estrogenic activity	2 mg/kg • d (EPA) LOAEL 10 mg/kg • d, NOEL 6.5 mg/kg • d (Europa)
Cosmetics and personal care products			
2,4-Dihydroxybenzophenone	UV absorber in polymers, sunscreen agent	Estrogenic activity	Not identified
3-Benzylidene camphor	UV blocker used in personal care products	Estrogenic activity	0.07 mg/kg · d (710)
4,4'-Dihydroxybenzophenone	UV light stabilizer used in plastics, cosmetics, adhesives, and optical fiber	Estrogenic activity	Not identified
Benzophenone-2	Used in personal care products such as aftershave and fragrances	Estrogenic activity, changes in T <sub>4</sub> , T <sub>3</sub> , and TSH levels, alterations in cholesterol profile	NOEL 10–333 mg/kg · d (711)
Benzophenone-3 Multiple use (other)	UV filter	Estrogenic, PPAR $\gamma$ activator	200 mg/kg • d (Europa)
Melamine	Flame-retardant additive and rust remover; used to make laminate, textile, and paper resins; metabolite of cyromazine	Affects voltage-gated K <sup>+</sup> and Na <sup>+</sup> channels and Ca <sup>2+</sup> concentrations in hippocampal neurons	63.0 mg/kg • d (FDA)
Resorcinol	Used in the manufacturing of cosmetics, dyes, flame retardants, hair dye formulations, pharmaceuticals, skin creams, and tires	Alters $\mathrm{T_4}$ and TSH levels	80.00 mg/kg · d (Europa)
Pesticides			
Aldrin <sup>a</sup>	Insecticide	Estrogenic activity	0.025 mg/kg • d (Health Canada)
Alachlor	Herbicide	Decreases serum T <sub>4</sub> , binds PR, weakly binds ER	1 mg/kg∙d (EPA)
Amitrole	Herbicide	Decreases thyroid hormone	0.12 mg/kg • d (FAO)
Bitertanol	Fungicide	Alters aromatase	30 mg/kg ∙ d (EPA)
Carbendazim	Fungicide	Affects FSH, LH, and testosterone levels; alters spermatogenesis and Sertoli cell morphology	8 mg/kg ∙ d (712)
Diazinon	Insecticide	Alters glucocorticoids	0.065 mg/kg • d (CDC)
Endrin <sup>a</sup>	Insecticide	Stimulates glucocorticoid receptor	0.025 mg/kg ∙ d (CDC)
Fenoxycarb	Insecticide	Alters acetylcholinesterase	260 mg/kg · d (CDC)
Mirex <sup>a</sup>	Insecticide	Decreases testosterone levels	0.075 mg/kg ⋅ d (CDC)
Zineb	Fungicide	Alters $T_4$ and dopamine levels	LOAEL 25 mg/kg · d (EPA)
Ziram	Fungicide	Alters norepinephrine levels	1.6 mg∕kg • d (EPA)
Resins	Used in a shared at the		
Bisphenol F	Used in polycarbonates	Alters T <sub>4</sub> , T <sub>3</sub> , and adiponectin levels, has estrogenic activity	LOAEL 20 mg/kg • d (713)
Styrene	Precursor to polystyrene	Alters dopamine	200 mg/kg · d (EPA)

# • HIGH DOSE: 10 000 PPB EXPOSURE • LOW DOSE: 1 PPB EXPOSURE

Mise au point

afssaps 🔾



Complications liées à l'exposition n utero au diéthylstilbestrol (DES)

Distilbène®, Stilboestrol-Borne®)

Actualisation 2011

Agence française de sécurité sanitaire des produits de santé

Agence française de sécurité sanitaire des produits de santé

> 143-147 boulevard Anatole France F-93285 Saint-Denis Cedex

> > www.afssaps.fr



Newbold RR, Padilla-Banks E, Jefferson WN, Heindel JJ 2008 Effects of endocrine disruptors on obesity. Int J Androl 31:201–208

# CONTROVERSY O Nat. Rev. Endocrin. 6 (2010), 237

### Editorial

Nature Reviews Endocrinology 6, 237 (May 2010)

Subject Category: Epidemiology

### The perils of plastic

### Vicky Heath About the author

A 'round-robin' spam e-mail that is circulating on servers worldwide claims that drinking bottled water that has been left in a warm car can cause breast cancer. Is this warning just an urban myth or does it hold a grain of truth? The FDA, it seems, is erring on the side of caution; earlier this year, the organization revised its position on the safety of bisphenol A (BPA), a chemical used in the manufacture of plastics. Previously deemed safe for food-contact use, the FDA has now expressed "some concern" about the potential health risks that BPA poses to fetuses, infants and young children.

Is society compromising its health for the conveniences of modern living? Industrial chemicals, such as BPA, are literally everywhere: in homes, in the workplace, even the great outdoors. They cannot possibly all be avoided. Given the current recommendations of the FDA and the Endocrine Society, a multidisciplinary approach is clearly needed—one that involves scientists, clinicians, policy makers and the chemicals industry—with the aim of gathering reliable data to form the basis of national and international public-health policies. In the meantime, the use of plastics and other man-made substances should be closely monitored in groups known to be at the greatest risk. Perhaps that e-mail is not spam after all.



# OF PACKAGING MATERI

Water Research 46(2012), 571-583



### [...]

Genotoxic and estrogenic activities in PETbottled water have been reported. Chemical mixtures in bottled water have been suggested as the source of these toxicological effects. [...]

Formaldehyde, acetaldehyde and antimony are clearly related to migration from PET into water. However, several studies have shown other theoretically unexpected substances in bottled water. The origin of these compounds has not been clearly established (PET container, cap-sealing resins, background contamination, water processing steps, NIAS, recycled PET, etc.).

[....]

# ESTROGENIC COMPOUNDS FROM PET??

### **ABC** Science

# **A** Recherche

2 RECENT STUDIES (Italian and German) on drinking water turbateurs endocriniens : restons vigilants»

1) involving a recombinant yeast-based in vitro assay (March 2009 in International Journal of Hygiene and Environmental Health) **estrogenic activity was** assessed in 30 PET-bottled mineral water samples. Ninety percent of the samples tested negative for estrogenic activity. Of the remaining samples, most showed measurements corresponding to a range of 14-23 ng/L estradiol equivalents—similar to the estrogen burden posed by treated drinking water derived from groundwater and river water (15 and 17 ng/L estradiol equivalents, respectively). boutellies plastique

reproduction. Dange

Involving mud snails (Potamopyrgus antipodarum) (10 March 2009, 2) Environmental Science and Pollution Research) **PET-housed snails produced up** to twice as many embryos as glass-housed snails..

**Reference = glass bottle water with same water.** 

epidemiologist at the University of Rochester School of Medicine and Dentistry in New York.

"This is coming at a good time because the use of bottles for consuming water is getting very bad press now because of its carbon footprint," she says. "It's just another nail in the coffin of bottled water, the way I see it."

Wagner and a colleague used genetically engineered yeast to analyse 20 samples of mineral water. Nine samples came out of glass bottles, nine were bottled in PET plastic and two were in cardboard, juice-like boxe

The specialised yeast, which change colour in the presence of estrogen-like compounds, revealed estrogeni activity in seven of the nine plastic bottles (and both cardboard samples), compared with just three of the nin alass ones

Overall, Wagner says, levels of these compounds in the water were surprisingly high

raugmentation du niveau d'obésité dans les populations occidentales Plusieurs centaines de substances sont actuellement classées parmi les perturbateurs endocriniens.

### Où les trouve-t-on ?

Ces molécules sont principalement détectées dans l'eau, puis dans toute la chaîne alimentaire. De plus, comme viennent de le montrer Martin Wagner et Jörg Oehlmann de l'université Goethe de Frankfort [1], peut-être aussi dans le plastique des bouteilles d'eau minérales en polyéthylène téréphtalate (PET).



# **RISK ASSESSMENT**



# \*\* efsa ::

# **European Food Safety Authority**

# http://www.efsa.europa.eu



CONTAM

### Scientific Committee

Senior scientists, with experience of work within scientific bodies, covering all disciplines across EFSA's areas of responsibility.



Panel on Animal Health and Welfare Experts in toxicology, toxicity, epidemiology, chemistry, exposure assessment, and microbiology.



Panel on Food Additives and Nutrient Sources Added to Food Experts in toxicology, toxicity, epidemiology, chemistry, exposure assessment, and microbiology.



Panel on Biological Hazards Experts in epidemiology, microbiology, pathology, and exposure assessment.



Panel on Contaminants in the Food Chain Experts in chemistry, exposure assessment, toxicology, epidemiology, and statistics



### Panel on Food Contact Materials, Enzymes, Flavourings and Processing Aids

Panel on Food Contact Materials, Enzymes, Flavourings and Processing Aids



Panel on Genetically Modified Organisms Experts in food and feed safety assessment, environmental sciences, molecular characterisation, and plant science.



Panel on Dietetic Products, Nutrition and Allergies Experts in nutrition, human medicine, exposure assessment, toxicology



Panel on Plant Health Experts in pest risk assessment, plant pathology, epidemiology, and ecology.

115

### FEEDAP



Panel on Additives and Products or Substances used in Animal Feed Experts in animal nutrition, toxicology, microbiology, exposure assessment, and



Panel on Plant Protection Products and their Residues Experts in chemistry, toxicology,

# REGULATION



### **PRINCIPLES OF FOOD INERTIA: A LONG HISTORY**

### L'ART DE CONSERVER, 8" ANNÉE. - Nº 19

JUILLET 1910

### LA CONSERVE ALIMENTAIRE PF

Pulletin mensuel de Vulgarisation Chéorique et Pratique de Fabrication

TOUTE PARAISSANT LE 15 DE CHAQUE MOIS Bedige par un groupe de Habricants-Industriels et de Chefs d'Emplois de cette Industrie Ouvn Man L'enseignement sera tout à la fois théorique sur l et pratique. Dans la voie pratique, le Comité de Direction se propose, non pas d'organiser une usine de fabrication de conserves et de produits alimentaires divers, destinée à concurrencer l'industrie libre, mais de créer des laboratoires d'essais et d'enseignement que dirigera un Proprie praticien qualifié et où chaque fabricant pourra ancie venir se documenter et concourir aux progrès la M de la science alimentaire Les essais théoriques seront dirigés par un technologue éminent, M. CROLBOIS, chef de laboratoire à l'Institut Pasteur. . Une très large place sera réservée, dans l'enseignement à la question des machines, appareils et ustensiles employés par l'Industrie alimentaire. Un ingénieur diplômé, M. RAY-Nicolas APPERT MOND MONOT, des usines de Diétrich, est chargé (1750-1841) d'organiser cette partie du programme. M. MORÉAL DE BRÉVANS, le distingué sous-École Nationale directeur du laboratoire municipal, a bien voulu se charger de l'enseignement si impor-D'INDUSTRIE ALIMENTAIRE tant de la chimie appliquée à l'alimentation. Enfin M. ED. JACQUET, ingénieur-agronome, administrateur de l'école, occupera la chaire Nicolas Appert de professeur d' « Alimentation Commerciale ». COMITÉ DE DIRECTION Ajoutons que notre bulletin transformé en revue bi-mensuelle à laquelle collaboreront Bourse du Commerce CHEZ P désormais les personnalités ci-dessus, devient - Paris le Bulletin Officiel de l'Ecole. NAPOL En un mot et suivant l'exemple d'autres L'idée de la création de cette école dont nous pays, une Université nouvelle et bien moderne avons été les plus fervents propagandistes vient de naitre en France, celle de l'Industrie vient d'être mise définitivement au point par Alimentaire. Cette industrie quitte ainsi, défiun groupe de praticiens, de chimistes et d'agro-

nomes distingués qui vont en assurer le tonc-

tionnement.

## 290

LA CONSERVE ALIMENTAIRE

sa place déjà marquée par les exigences et le progrès sans cesse grandis-ants de la vie contemporaine.

> Pour le Comité de Direction : Aug. CORTHAY.



### Méfions-nous des Conserves Étrangères

Nous donnons ci-dessous la traduction d'un extrait du passage que M. Hamel consacre à la législation et l'inspection des conserves alimentaires au Canada, dans le traité qu'il publie en ce moment. (Modern practice of canning meats):

« Comparés avec les règlements qui régissent l'inspection des conserves alimentaires aux Etats-Unis et en Europe, ceux du Canada sont encore à l'état embryonnaire.

Pour protéger les fabricants Canadiens contre la concurrence des Etats-Unis, il était nécessaire de créer une législation, au moins sur le papier.

« Je ne parle pas ici de l'inspection des viandes fraiches qui est soumise à un groupe de savants et de vétérinaires de valeur.

« Mais l'acheteur éclairé de conserves alimentaires quelles qu'elles soient, viandes, poissons, fruits ou légumes est loin d'avoir obtenu la mêm. sécurité.

«Le règlement en date de 1908 qui régit l'inspection des conserves alimentaires nous dit Aucune substance alimentaire ne doit contenir de produit nuisible, produits chimiques, colorants ou antiseptiques, et plus loin on nous dit : Il sera fourni aux Inspecteurs par les soins du Ministère de l'Agriculture les noms des anliseptiques et colorants inoffensifs dont l'emploi est permis. L'addition de tout autre empèchera le produit de recevoir l'éliquelle constatant l'inspection.

« Nous comprenons bien que les chimistes du Ministère sont là pour condamner tout produit alimentaire où l'analyse révèlerait la présence d'un produit chimique dangereux, mais pour ceux qui sont au courant des discussions en cours entre les hygiénistes les plus distingués du monde entier au sujet de la plus ou moins grande nocivité de tel ou tel antiseptique, la satisfaction est maigre.

« Je répète que le fabricant de conserves en boîtes n'a pas besoin d'antiseptiques pour assurer la conservation indéfinie de ses produits. La stérilisation lui suffit.

« Pourquoi donc ne pas faire comprendre au monde entier que les mots « CANADA APPROVED » de l'étiquette signifient absence entière de susbstances nuisibles, aussi bien dans les conserves que dans les viandes fraiches.

« Que si quelques antiseptiques sont considérés comme inoffensifs par le Ministère de l'Agriculture, pourquoi ne pas faire connaître au public comme aux fabricants le nom de ce qui est permis et de ce qui est prohibé?

« Le règlement de 1908 ne prend nullement en considération la qualité de la soudure employée, pas plus que celle de l'acide, et il semble que sur ce point les japonais sont bien en avance sur nous lorsqu'ils donnent les commandes pour leur armée.

« Pour en finir, il semble que des instructions plus complètes auraient été pour le plus grand intérêt du fabricant lui-même, en donnant au public consommateur une garantie parfaite de sécurité. La consommation en aurait été accrue en regagnant la confiance des consommateurs qui sont peu confiants dans les conserves, généralement sans raisons, d'ailleurs. »

G. T. HAMEL, ingénieur.

L'auteur l'aisant une œuvre purement technique et non de polémique est évidemment très modéré. Mais pour qui lit entre les lignes et pour nous qui savons combien sont rares parmi le personnel de l'inspection les gens compétents, toutes les places étant prises par les politiciens, nous ne nous sentons pas rassu-



Le règlement de 1908: « ...aucune substance alimentaire ne doit contenir de produit nuisible, produit chimiques... »

nitivement, le domaine empirique pour rentrer

dans celui des sciences exactes, où elle avait

1>>> INTRODUCTION/ FOOD SANITARY CONTEXT



YOU				
ROUTIN	Risk Tradeoff			
			Risk balancing	Conflicts
	role	Scientifc risk assessment	Conflict Evaluative	cognitive, evaluative, normative
	Routine	Conflict: cognitive	Targets:	Targets:DG SANCO, industry stakeholders
	Target: industry	Target: professional associations	efsa European Food Safety Authority	
	Discourse: internal	Discourse: cognitive	Discourse: reflective	Discourse: participatory
	Outcome: simple	Outcome: complex	Outcome: uncertain	Outcome: ambiguous



# WHAT IS RISK?

Risk is a function of perception and representation









# **REGULATION=TRANSFER OF RESPONSABILITIES**



### https://ec.europa.eu/food/safety/chemical\_safety/food\_contact\_materials\_en



- European professional organisations
- European Reference Laboratory on Food Contact Materials (EURL-FCM)
- European Food Safety Authority

### Training

FOOD

For government officials engaged in food and feed safety inspection of selected countries training on food contact materials is provided free of charge under BTSF. Also refer to the European Training Platform for Safer Food.

### Legislation

### I. General legislation

### The framework Regulation

Regulation (EC) No 1935/2004 provides a harmonised legal EU framework. It sets out the general principles of safety and inertness for all Food Contact Materials (FCMs).

The principles set out in Regulation (EC) No 1935/2004 require that materials do not:

- Release their constituents into food at levels harmful to human health
  Change food composition, taste and odour in an unacceptable way
- Change rood composition, caste and odour in an una
- Moreover, the framework provides:
  - for special rules on active and intelligent materials (they are by their design not inert)
  - · powers to enact additional EU measures for specific materials (e.g. for plastics)
  - the procedure to perform safety assessments of substances used to manufacture FCMs involving the European Food Safety Authority
  - rules on labelling including an indication for use (e.g. as a coffee machine, a wine bottle, or a soup spoon) or by reproducing the appropriate symbol. For more information, please refer to the following document on Symbols for labelling food contact materials.
  - · for compliance documentation and traceability

### **Regulation on Good Manufacturing Practices**

Regulation (EC) No 2023/2006 ensures that the manufacturing process is well controlled so that the specifications for FCMs remain in conformity with the legislation:

- · premises fit for purpose and staff awareness of critical production stages
- documented quality assurance and quality control systems maintained at the premises, and
- selection of suitable starting materials for the manufacturing process with a view to the safety and inertness of the final articles

Good manufacturing rules apply to all stages in the manufacturing chain of food contact materials, although the production of starting materials is covered by other legislation.

### II. EU legislation on specific materials

In addition to the general legislation, certain FCMs — ceramic materials, regenerated cellulose film, plastics (including recycled plastic), as well as active and intelligent materials — are covered by specific EU measures. There are also specific rules on some starting substances used to produce FCMs.

Plastic Materials		1
Active and Intelligent Materials		1
Recycled Plastic Materials	1	1
Ceramics		1
Regenerated Cellulose Film		1

### **III. Other Legislation**

### Legislation on Specific Substances

- Regulation 1895/2005/EC restricting use of certain epoxy derivatives in materials and articles intended to come into contact with food
- Directive 93/11/EEC release of N-nitrosamines and N-nitrosatable substances from rubber teats and soothers

### Overview of Community legislation (last update 20/10/2009)



# **SPECIFIC RULES FOR PLASTICS**

### **COMPLIANCE ISSUES**

SCIENCE & IMPAC



.0123

01/04/2020

# **Risk assessment vs risk management**

502 substances (including 230 monomers and 272 additives) among the 937, which are positively listed in EU directives on plastics in contact with food, are subjected to (SML)

EFSA: Risk Assessment ADI = NOEL/100 (per kg body weight)

DG SANCO: **Risk Management** SML= 60 \* ADI (mg intake per person per day from an assumed 1 kg packaged food)



- LOEL = Lowest Observed Effect Level
  - LOAEL = Lowest Observed Adverse Effect Level



# **SPECIFIC EU RULES FOR PLASTICS FOR FOOD CONTACT**

# Materials can be regulated alone or in combination with other materials

- list of substances
- purity standard for substances
- overall migration limits: OML (60 mg/kg or 10 mg/dm<sup>2</sup>)
- specific migration limits: SML
- other rules ensuring safety and inertness
- compliance, sampling, analytical methods, migration modeling
- traceability
- declaration of compliance

# **Plastic materials**

- exclusively plastics
- Plastic multilayers or layers tied with adhesives
- Plastic layers, coatings forming gaskets
- Plastic layers in multi-materials







# CHAINED STEPS, COMBINED MATERIALS Supply chain



Stepp

**Bottle body** 

Lid

Cap

food





# **HETEROGENEOUS EU REGULATIONS**

Variable concepts





**17 groups of materials** listed in Annex 1 of regulation 1935/2004/EC are still not covered by specific measures. They must be produced according to **Good Manufacturing Practices** (Regulation 2023/2006/EC) incl. 3 pillars: quality assurance system, quality control system, documentation.

.0129

01/04/2020





Contradictions and risk scale



SCIENCE & IMPACT

.0131

# DIFFUSION IN POLYMERS

OVERVIEW, BARRIER PROPERTIES, MIGRATION ISSUES



# > Is migration modeling a trusted science?



SAFETY OF FOOD CONTACT MATERIALS: PRINCIPLES All of the different parties involved are required to issue a declaration of compliance that states product safety.



### FDA U.S. FOOD & DRUG

"We have reviewed the proposed recycling process as well as the information you obtained from surrogate testing and migration modeling, which were submitted to demonstrate the capability of the proposed recycling process to remove potential contaminants from PCR-PET. Based on our review of these data, we have determined that the proposed recycling process, as described in the subject submission, ...."

https://www.fda.gov/Food/IngredientsPackagingLabeli ng/PackagingFCS/RecycledPlastics/default.htm

# > The principles of migration modeling = Tier modeling

- *conservalism.* modeling overestimates real migration.
- *reliability*. mass transfer pathways and substances obey to well-described mechanisms
- **consistency**.  $D_{i,P}$  and  $K_{i,F/P}$  are enough known with enough conservatism.
- *parsimony*. sophisticated and refined scenarios should be considered only when simplified ones fail.
- *proportionality*. non-compliance cannot be demonstrated by calculation.











### **MIGRATION ISSUES** CROSSED MASS TRANSFER OF FOOD CONTACT MATERIALS AND FOOD CONSTITUENTS





0

C

. To

C

Sec

4 C

















 $\frac{\partial C}{\partial t} = \frac{\partial}{\partial x} \left( D \frac{\partial C}{\partial x} \right)$ 







Molecules are represented as jumping beads. They have equal probabilities to hop to left and right directions.

The direction of the next hop at microscopic scale is indicated by the direction towards beads are staring.



Interpretation of the net flux J (first Fick Law) as the microscopic exchange of molecules at frequency v between states 1 and 2 separated by a distance dx.

# DIFFUSION IN POLYETHYLENE (0.5 NS SIMULATION, T=298 K)

# **10 molecules of helium**



# **10 molecules of methane**





 $\mathbf{D} \approx \frac{1}{6} \frac{\partial}{\partial t} \langle \mathbf{x}_{CM}(t) - \mathbf{x}_{CM}(0) \rangle^2$ 



## SCALING D WITH SOLUTE SIZE STIFF DIFFUSANTS





From: A. R. Berens, Pure Appl. Chem., 1981, 53, 365



# **SCALING EXPONENTS**

### FOR VARIOUS POLYMERS



Polyvinylidene chloride (PVDC) at 50% RH

△ Polyamide (PA)

× Polystyrene (PS)

\* High density Polyethylene pHDPE)

Low density polyethylene (LDPE)

Plasticized polyvinyl chloride (PVC)

Dry polyethylene terephthalate (PET or PETE)

Polyethylene terephthalate (PET) in contact with ethanol

Polypropylene (PP) in contact with glyceryl tripelargonate

Polypropylene (PP) at 40°C

+ Polypropylene (PP) at 70°C



http://www.tandfonline.com/doi/full/10.1080/10408398.2013.849654

Crit. Rev. Food Sci. Nut. 2015 (Fang & Vitrac)



# **ACTIVATION OF DIFFUSION BY TEMPERATURE**







.0143





For each temp. range:  $D = D_0 \cdot \exp\left(\frac{-Ea}{R \cdot T}\right)$ 

# **SCALING ACTIVATION ENERGY**

### VARIOUS DIFFUSANTS IN VARIOUS POLYMERS

$$Ea(M) \approx Ea(M_0) + ln(M/M_0)$$

Crit. Rev. Food Sci. Nut. 2015 (Fang & Vitrac) http://www.tandfonline.com/doi/full/10. 1080/10408398.2013.849654


## **OVERESTIMATING D VALUES**

 $\ln D_{(M,T)} = A'_P - 0.1351M^{2/3} + 0.003M - \frac{\tau + 10454}{\tau}$ **PIRGINGER EQUATION** 

#### **SAFETY MARGIN**



SCIENCE & IMPACT

Crit. Rev. Food Sci. Nut. 2015 (Fang & Vitrac) http://www.tandfonline.com/doi/full/10.1080/10408398.2013.849654

.0145 Piringer 01/04/2020

 $10^{3}$ 

## **ROBUSTNESS OF THE PIRINGER EQUATION**



## **INTUITIVE DEFINITION OF PARTITION COEFFICIENTS**





## **EFFECT OF PARTITION COEFFICIENT ON MIGRATION**

#### 50 times for chemical affinity for P 50 times for chemical affinity for F





$$K_{i,F/P} = \frac{C_{i,F}^{eq}}{C_{i,P}^{eq}} = \frac{1}{1 - crystallinity} \frac{\gamma_{i,P_{amorphous}}^{v}}{\gamma_{i,F}^{v}}$$

.0148 01/04/2020 **MIGRATION MODELING** AUTHORIZED IN EU, US, China

At each stage of manufacture, supporting documentation, substantiating the declaration of compliance, should be kept available for the enforcement authorities. Such demonstration of compliance may be based on migration testing. As migration testing is complex, costly and time consuming it should be admissible that compliance can be demonstrated also by calculations, including modelling, other analysis, and scientific evidence or reasoning if these render results which are at least as severe as the migration testing. Test results should be regarded as valid as long as formulations and processing conditions remain constant as part of a quality assurance system.

To screen for specific migration the migration potential can be calculated based on the residual content of the substance in the material or article applying generally recognised diffusion models based on scientific evidence that are constructed such as to overestimate real migration.





## **HOW TO OVERESTIMATE MIGRATION**

#### MODELING CAN DEMONSTRATE COMPLIANCE BUT NOT NON-COMPLIANCE



SCIENCE & IMPACT

## **MIGRATION MODELING**

**STATE OF THE ART (from lab to industry, from lab to food safety agencies)** 

**SCALE** 

.0151

01/04/2020





#### ALL SOFTWARE ARE BUILT ON SIMILAR ASSUMPTIONS

My Information ( user: demouser (change user) / project: common (change project) y database: common2013a.sfpp3.database.xml y Application: Diffusion_1DFV2n (change application) RA\SFPP3 - 2013-04-18 22:03:53		Archived simulations or templates	
Contact conditions	Layer selector           <<         >         >>         1	Help	
<ul> <li>● L_FP 100 m<sup>3</sup>F·m<sup>-3</sup>P import</li> <li>V_F</li></ul>	I_P       300       µm ●       ir         rho_P       1       g.cm-3 or       ir         K_F/P       0.1       ir       ir         D_P       1e-015       m2.s=1 ●       ir         Conc.       50       ppm ●       ir	Acetaldehyde         nport       Name: Acetaldehyde (Acetic         aldehyde;Ethanal;Ethyl       aldehyde;CH3CH0;Acetaldehyd;Aldehyde         acetique;Aldeide acetica;NCI-C563)       CAS: 75-07-0         REF: 10060       InChIKey: IKHGUXGNUITLKF-UHFFFAOYSA-N         Formula: C2H40       M: 44.053 g/mol         SML: 6 ppm       EFSA: Group TDI = 0.1 mg/kg b.w. (calculated as acetaldehyde (including 10060 and 23920)         Toxicity profiles similar to methaldehyde. A 2-year oral rat study and a 3-generation oral rat study including teratogenicity with methamethaldehide. The reports on nasal carcinogenicity after inhalation were considered without relevance for effects from oral intake of smaller doses, (adopted at 113rd SCF meeting)(17-18 September 1998)         http://europa.eu.int/comm/food/fs/sc/scf/out 16 en.html       FII Regulation: +Positive 1 ist	
Save result as:	Accept specific	able threshold or migration limit 6 ppm	

.0152

01/04/2020

SCIENCE & IMPACT

## **New trends: OPEN-SOURCE codes**

#### https://github.com/ovitrac/FMECAengine



			-
ovitrac / FMECAer	igine		@ Watch
IECA software developed tp://modmol.agroparistech	in the framework of the pro fr/SFPD/	oject SafeFoodPack Design	
3 61 commits	P 1 branch	% 0 releases	<ul> <li>1 contributor</li> </ul>
P branch moster - F	MECAengine / +		1
ix for load chemspider when it u	sed without any existing cache		
ovitrac authored 4 days ago			latest commit e335f0c651
examples	monolayer example upda	te	4 years ag
production	production examples, plic	sase change paths to match yours	4 years ag
Dfuller.m	Major Update - 10/05/201	4	11 months ag
Dheimroth m	Major Update - 10/05/201	4	11 months ag
Dimm.m	Major Update - 10/05/201	4	11 months ag
Dpiringer m	FMECAengine 0.51 (maj	or update) - though not fully tested	5 days ag
E FMECADfuller m	FMECAengine 0.51 (mail	or update) - though not fully tested.	5 davs ag
FMECADoiringer.m	FMECAerigine 0.51 (mail	or update) - though not fully tested	5 days ag
P FMECAKairP m	EMECAengine 0.51 imali	w undate) - though not fully tested	5 days an
EMECAeppine backup WSI	P. EMECAeronine 0.51 imale	v undate) - though not fully tested	5 days ag
FMECAmohumar m	EMECAeronine 0.51 (mail	or undate) - threads not fully tested	5 days an
FMECAkairm	EMECAennine 0.51 (ma)	v undate) - through not fully tested	5 days an
EMECAndemity m	EMECAcopine 0.51 (maj	sr update) - though not fully instead	5 days ag
Philippine	FMCCreating of 51 percent	a updato) - undegrine subjected	o unya ng
PHILODOLOGICAL STREET	FMCChangen 0.51 (map	n opdano) - unogri na ruhy narod	o ory ang
g FMECKVp.m	Philocovengene 0.51 (map	or updatel) - though not rully testing	s biys ag
NatchingClosingSymbol.m	release vu 45		4 years ag
g ModifiedGrainMethod.m	FMt:GAengine 0.51 (maj	ir update) - though not fully tested	5 days ag
E README	first commit		4 years ag
addax.m	additional functions to im	prove/simplify plots	3 years ag
addzplotpub m	additional functions to im	prove/simplify plots	3 years ag
argcheck m	publishing update		3 years ag
argpad.m	minor revisions and addit	lons	11 months ag
arrows.m	Major Update - 10/05/201	4	11 months ag
autoprefetch m	Major Update - 10/05/201	4	11 months ag
autoprojectname.m	Major Update - 10/05/201	4	11 months ag
B bordertext.m	Major Update - 10/05/201	4	11 months ag
boundedline m	Major Update - 10/05/201	4	11 months ag
buildmarkov.m	release v0.45		4 years ag
bykeywords.m	FMECAengine 0.51 (maj	or update) - though not fully tested	5 days ag
catstruct.m	release v0.45		4 years ag
cbrewer m	minor revisions and addit	lons	11 months ag
collemp m	release v0.45		4 years ag
checkCAS m	release v0.45		4 years ag
checktoolboxinstall m	FMECAengine 0.51 (maj	or update) - though not fully tested	5 days ag





## **DIMENSIONLESS FORMULATION**

#### **MONOLAYER / DIFFUSION + SORPTION**



C = concentration, l = thickness, m = mass, volume,  $\rho$  = density



K =partition coefficient (relative to mass concentration), L =dilution factor, Fo =Fourier number D diffusion coefficient, Bi =mass Biot number, h =surface mass transfer coefficient coefficient





*C* =concentration, *l* =thickness, *m* =mass, volume,  $\rho$  =density *K* =partition coefficient (relative to mass concentration), *L* =dilution factor, *Fo* =Fourier number *D* diffusion coefficient, *Bi* =mass Biot number, *h* =surface mass transfer coefficient coefficient

## **DIMENSIONLESS MIGRATION KINETICS**

**MONOLAYER MATERIAL** 

0.5

K = 0.5

1

Fo

1.5

2



0.2

0

0.5

Fo<sup>1/2</sup>

1













#### RULES OF THUMB FOR WORST CASE SCENARIOS MONOLAYER MATERIAL

$M = \frac{C_F^{(Fo)}}{C_F^{eq}}$ Dimension-less migration (migration ratio)	$Fo = \frac{tD_P}{l_P^2}$ Dimension- less time	
pprox 100%	1	
$\approx 50\%$	0.2	
pprox 10%	0.01	

Time to reach a given migration ratio:  $t = Fo \frac{l_P^2}{D_P}$ Concentration in food at time t:  $C_F(t) = M(Fo) \cdot C_F^{eq} = M(Fo) \cdot \frac{K \cdot L}{K + L} \cdot C_P^{t=0}$ 





$$K_{F/P} = \frac{C_F^{eq}}{C_P^{eq}} \to \infty, \ L_{P/F} = \frac{m_P}{m_F} = \frac{\rho_P V_P}{\rho_F V_F} \to 0, \ Bi = \frac{R_D}{R_H} \to \infty$$





1

 $\theta = F$ 

 $\mathcal{2}$ 

n

.0160

01/04/2020





### SIMULATION OF MULTILAYER MATERIALS

## Functional barrier = barrier to diffusion + sorption

## Idem + Iow chemical affinity for the food



prop	Layer 3	Layer 2	Layer 1	Food
C <sub>0</sub>	0	1	0	0
I/I <sub>o</sub>	1	1	1	100
$D/D_0$	1	1	0.1	10 <sup>4</sup>
k/k <sub>0</sub>	1	50	1	1



prop	Layer 3	Layer 2	Layer 1	Food
C <sub>0</sub>	0	1	0	0
۱/۱ <sub>0</sub>	1	1	1	100
D/D <sub>0</sub>	1	1	0.1	104
k/k <sub>o</sub>	1	50	1	20



## MODELING EXISTS ALSO FOR CHAINED STEPS





## **CHAINED STEPS**

.0163

01/04/2020



#### ASSESSING THE SEVERITY OF A SINGLE STEP CASE OF "SETOFF" STEP



#### Full methodology described in *AIChE J.* 2013, **59**(4), 1183-1212



Severity 
$$(\hat{C}_F(\text{step }i)) = f \left| \max \left| \underbrace{C_{F_M}}_{\text{comparison with step i removed}} - C_{F_M} \right|_{1 \to 2 \to \dots \to M/i}, C_{F_i} \right|_{i}$$

## COMPARING THE SEVERITY OF A SEVERAL STEPS, PACKAGING DESIGNS, SUBSTANCES...





Full methodology described in AIChE J. 2013, 59(4), 1183-1212



# CONCLUSIONS



#### leaks (sealants, stoppers)













## HUMAN RISK







Material flow

**Information flow** 













## **MAIN STEPS TO REVIEW**

	FMECA « milk for infants stored in a brick »				
Safe	Formulation	Design	Process	Informations	Mechanisms
oppdack Design	<b>Perference</b> <b>Formulation</b> <b>Formulation</b> <b>Formulation</b> <b>Formulation</b> <b>Formulation</b> <b>Formulation</b> <b>Formulation</b> <b>Formulation</b> <b>Formulation</b> <b>Formulation</b> <b>Formulation</b> <b>Formulation</b> <b>Formulation</b> <b>Formulation</b> <b>Formulation</b> <b>Formulation</b> <b>Formulation</b> <b>Formulation</b> <b>Formulation</b> <b>Formulation</b> <b>Formulation</b> <b>Formulation</b> <b>Formulation</b> <b>Formulation</b> <b>Formulation</b> <b>Formulation</b> <b>Formulation</b> <b>Formulation</b> <b>Formulation</b> <b>Formulation</b> <b>Formulation</b> <b>Formulation</b> <b>Formulation</b> <b>Formulation</b> <b>Formulation</b> <b>Formulation</b> <b>Formulation</b> <b>Formulation</b> <b>Formulation</b> <b>Formulation</b> <b>Formulation</b> <b>Formulation</b> <b>Formulation</b> <b>Formulation</b> <b>Formulation</b> <b>Formulation</b> <b>Formulation</b> <b>Formulation</b> <b>Formulation</b> <b>Formulation</b> <b>Formulation</b> <b>Formulation</b> <b>Formulation</b> <b>Formulation</b> <b>Formulation</b> <b>Formulation</b> <b>Formulation</b> <b>Formulation</b> <b>Formulation</b> <b>Formulation</b> <b>Formulation</b> <b>Formulation</b> <b>Formulation</b> <b>Formulation</b> <b>Formulation</b> <b>Formulation</b> <b>Formulation</b> <b>Formulation</b> <b>Formulation</b> <b>Formulation</b> <b>Formulation</b> <b>Formulation</b> <b>Formulation</b> <b>Formulation</b> <b>Formulation</b> <b>Formulation</b> <b>Formulation</b> <b>Formulation</b> <b>Formulation</b> <b>Formulation</b> <b>Formulation</b> <b>Formulation</b> <b>Formulation</b> <b>Formulation</b> <b>Formulation</b> <b>Formulation</b> <b>Formulation</b> <b>Formulation</b> <b>Formulation</b> <b>Formulation</b> <b>Formulation</b> <b>Formulation</b> <b>Formulation</b> <b>Formulation</b> <b>Formulation</b> <b>Formulation</b> <b>Formulation</b> <b>Formulation</b> <b>Formulation</b> <b>Formulation</b> <b>Formulation</b> <b>Formulation</b> <b>Formulation</b> <b>Formulation</b> <b>Formulation</b> <b>Formulation</b> <b>Formulation</b> <b>Formulation</b> <b>Formulation</b> <b>Formulation</b> <b>Formulation</b> <b>Formulation</b> <b>Formulation</b> <b>Formulation</b> <b>Formulation</b> <b>Formulation</b> <b>Formulation</b> <b>Formulation</b> <b>Formulation</b> <b>Formulation</b> <b>Formulation</b> <b>Formulation</b> <b>Formulation</b> <b>Formulation</b> <b>Formulation</b> <b>Formulation</b> <b>Formulation</b> <b>Formulation</b> <b>Formulation</b> <b>Formulation</b> <b>Formulation</b> <b>Formulation</b> <b>Formulation</b> <b>Formulation</b> <b>Formulation</b> <b>Formul</b>	two components: brick body (4 materials, 5 layers) cap (two materials incl. the sealing system) six materials LDPE, PP (cap) aluminum foil cardboard (origin) « ink » « adhesives »	<ul> <li>Process</li> <li>production, storage, assembly of materials</li> <li>assembly and storage of components</li> <li>printing (printing technology, curing/drying)</li> <li>storage of empty packaging</li> <li>aseptic packaging filling (temperature, pretreatment)</li> <li>storage and retailing of the bricks filled with milk</li> <li>conditions of use or storage by the consumer/end-user: chilled, ambient, oven heating?</li> <li>Consumption-type (bottle feed</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>Informations</li> <li>identity and nature of materials in assemblies</li> <li>formulation of materials (substances specifically regulated or not)</li> <li>test conditions used to evaluate the risk of contamination</li> <li>conditions of preparation, packaging filling, storage, consumption of packaged food</li> <li>communication of revisions and modifications in la formulation, design, process and in the final use</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>Described mechanisms</li> <li>diffusion across layers</li> <li>set-off</li> <li>cross-contamination between materials and with the storage ambience</li> <li>effects of poor drying and curing on printing inks</li> </ul>
Collaborative research project SAFEF	<ul> <li>Highly concentrated         <ul> <li>antioxidants, lubricants, biocides</li> <li>mineral oils, photoinitiators</li> <li>monomers, catalysts, solvents</li> <li>other residues</li> </ul> </li> </ul>	Barrier material aluminum foil Materials acting as reservoir of low molecular weight contaminants ink adhesive Materials acting as reservoir of high molecular weight of contaminants PP, LDPE paper and board	<ul> <li>with direct contact between the mouth and the neck)</li> <li>steps associated to long-time contact         <ul> <li>storage of materials</li> <li>storage of components</li> <li>storage of finished products</li> <li>steps associated to high temperatures</li> <li>aseptic filling</li> <li>oven heating</li> <li>storage</li> <li>printing</li> <li>assembling / laminating</li> </ul> </li> </ul>	<ul> <li>non-documented or missing information</li> <li>accessible information</li> <li>documented information, which follow each component and materials</li> <li>verifiable and auditable information</li> <li>frequency of update of information : regular, when a change occur, only when the design is modified,</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>mass transfer, which can be evaluated rapidly from calculations: from, trough LDPE, PP layers</li> <li>mass transfer, which can be tested experimentally in a simple manner : set-off</li> <li>mass transfer, which require a depth expertise: cross- contamination, aging</li> </ul>



Calculate criticity

## ROADMAP TO USE MIGRATION MODELING FOR SAFER FCM

Go to the market

